

1 Comments by Associate editor, Rebecca Hodge

Public justification (visible to the public if the article is accepted and published):

Thanks to the authors for these edits. I see that the editorial office have requested that "Appendix 1" and "Appendix 2" are changed to "Appendix A" and "Appendix B" accordingly. I would like to suggest a further three very minor edits:

The explanation of the transport length in the response letter is helpful, and I think that it would be useful to add this into the paper. Related to this, I also think that the sentence in section 2.2. "Transport length is a more relevant parameter for defining an impact flux than the hop length used by SD2004, as the latter refers to a characteristic of the grain trajectory" needs a little more explanation.

Reply: Done. I hope it is clearer to you now

Can I check the changes in lines 75 and 76 (in the tracked changes version). τ^{*cr^a} has been introduced in this version in addition to A^* , but should it actually be in place of A^* ? If it is in addition to A^* , then A^* needs to be defined.

Reply: Done. I realize that part of my previous explanation was missing from the previous version. The A^* constant, which is used in the Meyer-Peter and Mueller formula, has now been defined.

Please add to the Figure 6 caption to say that the colour bar units are in m.

Reply: Done.