

egusphere-2026-1805

Extreme Extratropical Cyclones in a Warmer Climate: Assessing Signal Robustness and Model Uncertainty

Lara C. Mercier, Hilla Afargan-Gerstman, Matthew D. K. Priestley, Jens H. Christensen, and Daniela I.V. Domeisen

Dear Lara Mercier and co-authors

Given the topic of your paper submitted to WCD, it was with interest that I had a look at your manuscript. But then I discovered several issues with your references:

You reference a paper by Laïne et al. 2009, which does not exist. I am listed as co-author, but I don't know of a colleague with the name Laïne and we never wrote a paper with this title and team. I found this strange and then looked also at other references a bit closer:

- The paper by Brenowitz and Bretherton has a different title; the correct one is “Prognostic Validation of a Neural Network Unified Physics Parameterization”.
- The paper by Catto et al. 2019 is listed with the wrong co-authors.
- The DOI of Chang 2016 points to a different paper with the title “The Response of the Southern Ocean and Antarctic Sea Ice to Freshwater from Ice Shelves in an Earth System Model” by Pauling et al. (without Chang as co-author).
- A paper with the title you reference as “Chang 2016” appeared as “Chang 2013”:
<https://journals.ametsoc.org/view/journals/clim/26/24/jcli-d-13-00209.1.xml>
- Binder et al. 2023 has a different title than the one you mention; the paper you reference appeared in 2016. But the 2023 paper would make more sense.
- You repeatedly reference Pfahl et al. 2015c when you mention diabatic cyclone intensification, but Pfahl et al. 2015c is mainly about blocking.

There might be more issues. This rather long list and the “invented names” might point to the improper use of AI. Please check the AI policy of Copernicus journals; it is an author obligation to avoid AI-generated hallucinated data, and generally the usage of AI for the preparation of manuscripts has to be acknowledged:

https://www.weather-climate-dynamics.net/policies/ai_policy.html

In addition, authors have to confirm during submission (by checking a box) that they are aware that they have to declare the use of AI tools to generate (parts of) their manuscript.

<https://www.weather-climate-dynamics.net/submission.html>

With best regards,
Heini