

Organic vapors from Savannah and European Boreal fire emissions: Insights from photochemical and dark aging experiments in a smog chamber

Deeksha Shukla, Lejish Vettikkat, Mika Ihalainen, Markus Somero, Hendryk Czech, Siegfried Schobesberger, Angela Buchholz, Iida Pullinen, Kerneels Jaars, Kajar Köster, Viet Le, Pasi Yli-Pirilä, Stefan Siebert, Pieter van Zyl, Annele Virtanen, Ville Vakkari, Olli Sippula, and Ralf Zimmermann

The authors have responded constructively to my previous comments and have substantially improved the manuscript. In particular, the revised version now provides a more explicit discussion of the limitations associated with laboratory biomass-burning experiments and chamber aging, clarifies the scope of the low-NO_x dark-aging experiments, provides additional information on fuel moisture, emission-factor calculations, oxidant exposures, and instrumental uncertainties, and more clearly acknowledges the limitations associated with the unassigned fraction of the PTR-MS signal and the inability to distinguish structural isomers. These revisions satisfactorily address the main scientific concerns raised in my previous review.

The revised manuscript would benefit from a careful editorial check, as several editing artifacts and typographical inconsistencies remain. For example, duplicated or partially retained versions of sentences/equations are still visible in the Methods section, and some passages in the Conclusions contain repeated text. There are also apparent typographical errors that should be verified, such as the statement that flaming combustion is associated with MCE values “larger than 0.1,” which appears inconsistent with the subsequent MCE thresholds. In addition, some sentences contain residual editing artifacts (e.g., “Aln additionally”) and duplicated wording in the discussion of SOA precursors. I therefore recommend a final thorough proofreading of the manuscript to ensure that all tracked-change remnants, duplicated text, typographical errors, and formatting inconsistencies are removed before publication.