

Title: Rock fracture characteristics regulate water storage and seasonal tree water uptake in karst

Author(s): Xiuqiang Liu, Xi Chen, Zhicai Zhang, Weihan Liu, Tao Peng, and Jeffrey J. McDonnell

MS No.: egosphere-2025-3937

MS type: Research article

5

Reviewer 2:

Comments on egosphere-2025-3937

The revised manuscript has addressed most of my concerns; however, I still have one remaining issue: the study should adopt a more rigorous and systematic approach to acknowledge its limitations and
10 uncertainties.

Response: We thank the reviewer for this insightful comment and agree that the manuscript should more clearly acknowledge its limitations and associated uncertainties. To address this, we have added a new section (Section 4.4) that provides a more systematic discussion of the main limitations of this study. In particular, we clarify that our results are based on a single lithological setting (limestone) under a
15 subtropical climate, which may limit their broader applicability. We also discuss uncertainties related to isotope-based source partitioning and MRT estimation in heterogeneous fractured systems, as well as the simplifications involved in representing complex fracture networks using discrete categories. In addition, we have expanded the discussion of future research directions, highlighting the need to test the generality of our findings across different lithologies and climatic regimes, and to better integrate structural
20 information and root observations into ecohydrological modelling frameworks. We believe these revisions provide a clearer and more balanced assessment of the scope and limitations of the study.