

Review of “Separating the Twomey Effect and the Semi-Direct Effect in Absorbing Aerosol Environments through the Cloud-Aerosol Mixing Ratio” (Manuscript ID: egusphere-2025-3777)

Authors have addressed my comments satisfactorily and the updated manuscript is much clearer after their revisions. I recommend minor revisions below and recommend this work for publication.

### **Minor Comments**

- Please explicitly state in the text that the aerosol measurements “include both interstitial aerosols and in-droplet aerosols”.
- L18: To keep notation standardized, please replace ACI with ACI\_Nd as in L19.
- L261: for clarity, please rephrase to “at supersaturated conditions” because “under” could be misinterpreted.
- L309: Please cite: Hilario, M. R. A., Bañaga, P. A., Betito, G., Braun, R. A., Cambaliza, M. O., Cruz, M. T., Lorenzo, G. R., MacDonald, A. B., Pabroa, P. C., Simpas, J. B., Stahl, C., Yee, J. R., and Sorooshian, A.: Stubborn aerosol: why particulate mass concentrations do not drop during the wet season in Metro Manila, Philippines, *Environ. Sci.: Atmos.*, 2, 1428–1437, <https://doi.org/10.1039/D2EA00073C>, 2022.
- L311: Since this is a new paragraph, please specify what variable the “overall mean” refers to.
- Table 2: Please also include the units of PM2.5 and LWC.
- Fig. S1: Define NRB.
- Fig. S4: Since the SI is separate from the main text, please include the description from Fig 8’s caption on the colors and shapes.