Editor comments are in , our responses are in black.

-> please indicate that/how the manuscript reflects the unclear cause of the effect.

In the previous iteration, we commented the following to this question:

Interesting comment, one option that could explain the higher yield for mustard in the combined basalt-biochar treatment relative to the biochar-only treatment in the first harvest but not in the second harvest could be a short-term nutrient retention of basalt-released nutrients by biochar. By the second harvest, these nutrients may have been depleted or leached, reducing the synergy effect. However, this is a speculative explanation and we therefore wish to leave this interpretation out.

We clarify here and in the discussion of the manuscript that the cause of this effect was unclear: Added in **line 391**: Mustard yield was higher in the combined basalt + biochar treatment than in the single-amendment treatments in the first harvest, but this difference was not observed in the second harvest. Because overall yield levels did not differ between harvests, a general seasonal effect appears unlikely. The mechanism underlying this transient response in the combined treatment remains unclear.

-> please provide justification

We used linear mixed-effects models (lmer) to account for the repeated-measures structure of the data and to test the fixed effects of basalt, biochar, and their interaction, with experimental unit as a random effect. Although weathering dynamics may initially show an exponential behavior, a linear model is more appropriate for our dataset with low temporal resolution. Given the limited number of sampling points, simpler linear models reduce the risk of overfitting.

We added this to the method section in **line 219**: Although weathering dynamics may initially show an exponential behavior, a linear model is more appropriate for our dataset with low temporal resolution. The mixed linear model was fitted using the lmer function from the lme4 package, after which a multiple anova was done using the anova function from the car library in R.