

2nd review of

Do convection-permitting regional climate models have added value for hydroclimatic simulations? A test case over small and medium-sized catchments in Germany

By Oakley Wagner, Verena Maleska, and Laurens M. Bouwer

General Comments

The paper has been well extended by the suggestions of the reviewers. By now it provides a comprehensive overview about the CPRCM results and their usage for hydrological modelling. Some important aspects regarding the hydrological simulation results were added, such as soil moisture, which bring light into the model behaviour at the analysed event with the different inputs. The model calibration results as well as the reasons of mismatching in some catchments are now well discussed. The discussion part and the conclusions have been extended by important parts (e.g., L650 ff), from which it can be concluded that it is important to capture both the spatial distribution of the input and the spatial differences in catchment states (snow and soil moisture). The conclusions further point out the challenges using raw or corrected climate model results in climate change impact studies and underline the need for ensemble studies also for convection permitting models. I recommend publication together with the appendix with some minor, rather technical, corrections (see below, page and line numbers refer to the document with the author's tracked changes).

Technical comments

P. 8 / L. 139: I would leave out "however"

P. 9 / L. 171: Insert "focussing": ... calibrated focussing on (1) ...

P. 17 / L. 337 – L. 341: I believe, the inserted paragraph could be left out, this should be clear for modellers. The question is, do we want a better resolution or is smoothing ok, when data are highly uncertain?

P. 23 / L. 440: In S18 it seems the results with the climate models have a larger variation in the 99.5th percentiles. Is this connected to the generally higher number of simulated high discharge peaks? Perhaps you can add a sentence to this.

P. 24 / Fig. 14: Please distinct the plots above (e.g., by adding a, b, c, d).