

Report on egusphere-2025-1703

Without expressing my opinion regarding the correctness or incorrectness of the expressions in Ann. Geophysicae, 30, 1051–1054, (2012), I should note that the derivation in the Appendix of the Comment is extremely inaccurate. Eq. (A1) is written for the Fourier components but contains the factor $\exp(-i\omega t + ikz)$, which should not be there. Eq. (A3) contains δ in the right-hand side. What is this δ ? Upon substitution of (A7) into (B3), the factor 1/2 is lost. Substitution of (C14) into (C5) does not seem to be correct:

$$\begin{aligned} & -\omega \frac{v_{T\perp}^2}{v_{T\parallel}^2} \pm \omega_c \left(1 - \frac{v_{T\perp}^2}{v_{T\parallel}^2} \right) \\ &= \frac{T_{\perp}}{T_{\parallel}} \left(-\omega \pm \omega_c \left(\frac{T_{\parallel}}{T_{\perp}} - 1 \right) \right), \quad \text{Pokhotelov and Balikhin} \\ &\neq \frac{T_{\perp}}{T_{\parallel}} \left(-\omega \pm \omega_c \frac{T_{\parallel}}{T_{\perp}} \left(\frac{T_{\parallel}}{T_{\perp}} - 1 \right) \right), \quad \text{this comment} \end{aligned}$$

There is no reason to publish the comment.