- 1 Title: Spatiotemporal variation of growth-stage specific concurrent climate
- 2 extremes and their yield impacts for rice in southern China
- 3 Response to Report #1:
- 4 Submitted on 03 Sep 2025
- 5 Referee #2: Faranak Tootoonchi, faranak.tootoonchi@gmail.com
- 6 Thanks. The paper has improved. I have a few more comments. Please note that the
- 7 line numbers are related to the version in track-change mode and NOT the clean
- 8 version.
- 9 **RE:** Thank you so much for your comments and suggestions on our manuscript. We have
- responded to the comments and suggestions point-by-point below (in blue). **The line numbers**
- 11 are related to the track-change version.
- 12 **Major Comments:**
- 13 L14: To capture
- **RE:** Thank you. We have revised the sentence accordingly as requested. The new sentence is:
- 15 "Existing studies predominantly rely on the whole growing-season scale and relative thresholds,
- and limit the ability to capture crop physiological sensitivities and yield responses that vary
- critically across growth stages." (Line 15).
- 18 **L204: Stressor**
- 19 **RE:** Thank you. We have revised it as requested (Line 170).
- 20 **L204: This concept**
- 21 **RE:** Thank you. We have revised it as requested (Line 170).
- 22 **L216: The trigger of is unclear.**
- 23 **RE:** Thank you. We have revised the text by replacing "The trigger of" with "The threshold of"
- for clarity (Line 182).
- 25 L216-218: Not sure why we need this sentence about other studies having other
- 26 threshold/cut-off values.
- 27 **RE:** Thank you. We have removed the sentence and retained only the references (Lines 183-
- 28 184).
- 29 L251-261: Consider adding the suitable reference you used to extract these
- 30 steps. https://wires.onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1002/wat2.1579 could work.
- 31 **RE:** Thank you so much. We missed this reference (Tootoonchi et al., 2022) in the previous

- 32 version and have now added it (Line 206).
- 33 L264:269: These sentences are not needed in my view. The text is a bit
- encyclopedic and distracts the flow. Consider removing the section but adding
- 35 references in the previous paragraph.
- 36 RE: Thank you for the suggestion. We have removed the corresponding sentences and
- 37 incorporated the relevant references in Line 205. This revision ensures that the section remains
- 38 focused exclusively on methodological content without unnecessary encyclopedic details.
- 39 L281-283: This sentence is unclear to me.
- 40 **RE:** In our definition, if no extreme event occurs in a given year, the severity score is set to "0".
- When fitting copula, we did not include these zero-severity years. However, when calculating
- 42 the joint exceedance probability, these zero values must be considered again to ensure that all
- 43 years (including those without extreme events) are accounted for. We have revised the text into
- a more straightforward description (Lines 226-228).
- Eq 10 and eq 13: Why do you need eq10? Why not to directly use eq13?
- **RE:** The two equations serve different purposes. Equation 10 was used to estimate the trend in
- 47 the historical yield time series, while Equation 13 was to derive the statistical relationship
- between yield anomaly and compound severities. In the previous version, we have mistakenly
- 49 used identical symbols for regression coefficients in the two equations, which was misleading.
- This has been corrected in the revision (Lines 293-296).
- 51 L551:552: Please rewrite the sentence.
- 52 **RE:** Thank you. We have corrected this sentence (Line 439).
- 53 A general comment: Please re-read the paper thoroughly to see if further
- technical language/ sentence modifications are required.
- **RE:** Thank you. We have thoroughly re-read the paper and carefully checked all technical
- language and sentence structures. Corrections and improvements have been made for the lines
- 57 22, 52, 78-79, 104, 106, 141, 144, 359, 401, 404, 412, 469, 480, 504-505, 521.
- 58 **References:**
- Tootoonchi, F., Sadegh, M., Haerter, J. O., Räty, O., Grabs, T., & Teutschbein, C. (2022).
- 60 Copulas for hydroclimatic analysis: A practice-oriented overview. WIREs Water, 9(2),
- e1579. https://doi.org/10.1002/wat2.1579