

Review of »OpenMindat v1.0.0 R package: A machine interface to Mindat open data to facilitate data-intensive geoscience discoveries«

by Que+

reviewer: Dominik Hezel

ms received: 05.02.2025

review completed: 04.03.2025

The authors greatly improved their manuscript compared to its first version, and I find this an exciting, highly important, and interesting read – but even more so, a fantastic R package. I only have some minor comments below, and am now looking forward to finally see this paper published.

Detailed comments

1. 59: I was excited to read there might also be a python package, but this is only mentioned here. So either delete or make some more statement here or later that there is also a python package in the works, and provide some hint to when this might be released.
2. Table 1: Why is the meteoritics volume number in red?
3. 84: I find the term »address« confusing. Could this be simply replaced by e.g., »hierarchy«? A hierarchy can have levels, so this might be more descriptive than »address«.
4. 87: »tectonic plate«?
5. 88ff: The bracket starting with »(Studies of ...)« is confusing. Maybe this could be made as a proper sentence that has a better connection to its previous sentence.
6. 114: Delete »above«
7. 115: Delete »us«
8. 119: Delete extra space before »it supports«
9. 173: »This function category ...«? cf. your Table 6
10. 184: »... few lines of code ...« would be more idiomatic
11. 224: »... code are shared ...«
12. 231: »... section, is also shared ...«
13. 233: Delete »those«
14. 235: I don't think the tool is reproducible, but it allows for reproducible data query. Rephrase accordingly.
15. 239: »interactions« instead of »interventions«
16. 239 »webpages« or rather »webpage«?
17. 242: »... programming skills, but require large datasets ...«

18. 250: The FAIR principles and open science are two different things. An e.g., database can be FAIR but not open, i.e., there is e.g., a paywall. This is not overly important in this context, but regarding these principles and concepts are still new to many, I would suggest to make it clear that these are different things.
19. 251: ›... is increasingly demanded in the ...‹