

Dear Dr. N. Kuhn

We are uploading a new version of the MS *EGUSPHERE-2023-2023* that provides a comment on a previous article published at *SOIL*. In crafting this new version, we follow your suggestions and the comments of the reviewers. Please find below an answer to your specific recommendations.

Thanks for your help,

Best regards,

José Paruelo

Response to the Handling editor comments:

We recommend that the manuscript should be "reconsidered after major revisions" taking into account the following points:

-The quality of the manuscript does not currently meet the required standards for *SOIL*. The text needs major revision to present a more focused and shorter manuscript.

*We revised the whole MS, we eliminated some sections and we end up with a MS (2884 words vs 3677 in the previous version)*

-The manuscript needs revising following the recommendations of both reviewers to make broader points on perceived weaknesses in the data analysis and interpretation. The more rambling commentary and review-like nature of the text needs to be reduced.

*We eliminated from the MS the section related with our criticism on the novelty of the results (section 2.2.).*

-The concluding remarks (section 3) do not relate at all to the manuscript being commented on and should be removed.

*We removed it.*

-Regarding comments on a lack of in-country authorship we ask that these comments should be revised to focus on whether there are weaknesses in the interpretation and conclusions of this manuscript which could be attributed to a lack of local knowledge. We ask that any personal comments or criticisms of the authors are removed, and also that any broader opinions about inclusivity in global research are removed.

*We removed this comment from the text, and we focus our criticisms on the how the study was performed and on the conclusions of the authors.*

For information, there are specific EGU guidelines in preparation titled "Good practice for inclusivity in global research" which are currently undergoing review and will be applied across all EGU journals. However, we do not have any rule which prohibits the publication of articles which do not have in-country authors.

I will be glad to see such guidelines.