HESS Opinions: Are soils overrated in hydrology? 1 2 Hongkai Gao ^{1,2}*, Fabrizio Fenicia ³, Hubert H.G. Savenije ⁴ 3 4 ¹ Key Laboratory of Geographic Information Science (Ministry of Education of China), East 5 China Normal University, Shanghai, China 6 ² State Key Laboratory of Tibetan Plateau Earth System and Resources Environment (TPESRE), Institute of Tibetan Plateau Research, Chinese Academy of Sciences, Beijing, China 7 8 ³ Eawag, Swiss Federal Institute of Aquatic Science and Technology, Dubendorf, Switzerland ⁴ Water Resources Section, Delft University of Technology, Delft, the Netherlands 9 10 *Corresponding to: Hongkai Gao (hkgao@geo.ecnu.edu.cn, gaohongkai2005@126.com) 11

12 Abstract

13 Traditional "physically-based" hydrological models theories are based on the assumption that soil 14 is key in determining water's fate- in the hydrological cycle. According to these models theories, 15 soil hydraulic properties determine water movement in both saturated and unsaturated zones, 16 described by matrix flow formulas knownsuch as the Darcy-Richards equations. Soil properties 17 would They also determine plant available moisture and thereby control transpiration. These-18 models are data demanding, computationally intensive, parameter rich and, as we shall show, Here 19 we argue that these theories are founded on a wrong assumption. Instead, we argue advocate the 20 reverse: it is the movement of the the terrestrial ecosystem manipulates the soil to satisfy specific water through a porous medium, creating preferential patterns, that determines soil properties;-21 22 while water movement is management strategies, which are primarily controlled by the 23 ecosystem'sits reaction to the climatic drivers- and by prescribed boundary conditions such as 24 topography and lithology. According to this assumption, soil hydraulic properties are a-25 "consequencean "effect", rather than a "cause" of water movement. It is not the soil We further argue that is in control of hydrology, it is the ecosystem. the integrated hydrological behaviour of 26 27 an ecosystem can be inferred from considerations about ecosystem survival and growth, without Page 1 of 42

28 relying on internal process descriptions. An important and favourable consequence of this climate 29 and ecosystem-driven approach is that models developed with this approach it provides a physical 30 justification for catchment models that do not requirerely on soil information, are computationally 31 cheap, and parsimonious. Our assumption is motivated by several arguments. Firstly, in well-32 developed soils the dominant flow mechanism is preferential, which is not particularly related to-33 soil properties, such as pF curves. Secondly, we observe that it is the ecosystem, rather than the-34 soil, that determines the land-surface water balance and hydrological processes. Top-down-35 analysis by large sample datasets reveal that soil properties are often a poor predictor ofhydrological signatures. Bottom-up hydrological models usually do not directly use field-36 measurements of the soil, but "rebalance" the observed soil texture and translate it to soil structure 37 38 by vegetation indices. Thus, soil-based models may be appropriate at small spatio-temporal scale-39 in non-vegetated and agricultural environments, but introduce unnecessary on the complexity and 40 sub-optimal results in catchments with permanent vegetation. Progress in hydrology largely relies-41 on abandoning the compartmentalized approach, putting ecosystem at the centre of hydrology, and 42 moving to a landscape based associated to the description of soil water dynamics. Another 43 consequence is that modelling approach. This change inwater movement in the soil, if required, 44 can benefit from the constraints that are imposed by the embedding ecosystem. Here we illustrate 45 our ecosystem perspective is needed to build of hydrological processes and the arguments that 46 support it. We suggest that advancing our understanding of ecosystem water management 47 strategies is key to building more realistic and simpler hydrological models that go beyond current 48 stationarity assumptions, but instead regard catchments as the result of ecosystems' coevolution-49 with atmosphere, biosphere, hydrosphere, pedosphere, and lithosphere. theories and catchment 50 models that are predictive in the context of environmental change. 51

52 1 IntroductionA change in perspective

Soil is important. It in hydrology. Soil forms the substrate of the terrestrial ecosystem and hence it
is a crucial element of the critical zone of life on Earth (Lin et al., 2006; Banwart et al., 2017).

55 Recently it Through its porous structure, exercising capillarity against gravity, it provides water
 56 storage against droughts and nutrients for plant growth.

57 It has been demonstrated argued that the soil forms an ecosystem in itself, full of micro-biotic and

58 macrobiotic life (Ponge, 2015); Weil and Brady, 2017). Fungi forming dense underground

- 59 networks live in symbiosis with vegetation, exchanging nutrients for carbon, which makes them
- 60 responsible for the larger part of subterranean carbon storage (Domeignoz-Horta et al., 2021).
- 61 Soils are full of life. Above ground livelife cannot survive without sub-surface life; they are both-
- 62 part of the same ecosystem. How this ecosystem functions, evolves and survives depends on
- 63 Soils are embedded in the elimatic and geological boundary conditions. Throughterrestrial
- 64 <u>ecosystems, which through</u> evolution and natural selection, the ecosystem hashave found ways to
- 65 make best use of the climatic and geologicalits resources. In doing so, The processes and structure
- 66 of a terrestrial ecosystem are mainly controlled by external factors which are largely prescribed.
- 67 Among them, climate plays a major role, as rainfall patterns and seasonal temperatures strongly
- 68 affect the distribution of vegetation types; other external factors include topography, lithology,
- 69 which determines parental material, and potential biota (Chapin et al., 2011). Given these
- 70 boundary conditions, a terrestrial ecosystem adjust its internal behaviour to satisfy its needs, and it
- 71 manipulates the substrate on which it grows. It manipulates
- 72 In particular, the soil is the result of a long-term evolution of terrestrial ecosystems given their
- 73 <u>boundary conditions. The classic *clorpt* model presented by Hans Jenny's famous 1941 book "The</u>
- 74 Factors of Soil Formation" states that s = f(cl, o, r, p, t, ...), where soil properties (s) are seen as
- 75 <u>a function of climate (*cl*), biotic effects (*o* for organisms), topography (*r* for relief), parent material</u>
- 76 (p), time (t), additional factors such as fire (represented by the dots) (Huggett, 2023). This model
- 77 suggests that soil properties are largely determined by the embedding ecosystems.
- 78 Managing water is an essential task of terrestrial ecosystems, as water is essential to life. And it is
- 79 not a trivial task, as it implies bridging dry weather periods, but also avoiding troubles caused by
- 80 sustained or heavy rainfall, such as water stagnation or soil erosion. We argue that terrestrial
- 81 ecosystems achieve this balance by manipulating key hydrological characteristics such as:

- 82 interception capacity, infiltration capacity, moisture storage capacity, preferential pathways to
- 83 replenish moisture stocks and recharge, and subsurface drainage. So, soil is regarded as the key to-
- 84 hydrological processes (Lin et al., 2006). Yet, in (most established) hydrological models, soils are
- 85 simplified to soil classifications (Freeze and Harlan, 1969; Refsgaard et al., 2022), such as sandy,
- 86 clayey, or loamy soils with their related soil characteristics, such as porosity, moisture retention-
- 87 capacity, wilting point, plant available moisture, etc., which are subsequently combined by the-
- 88 rooting depth of the dominant vegetation <u>According to this view</u>, a terrestrial ecosystem
- 89 <u>manipulates the soil hydraulic properties to satisfy specific water management strategies(e.g.</u>
- 90 Drewniak, 2019, Lu et al., 2019). But this is the wrong way round.
- 91 Yet, the most established hydrological theories parameterize water fluxes using soil attributes such
- 92 as texture, porosity, moisture retention capacity, wilting point, plant available moisture, etc. (e.g.
- 93 Drewniak, 2019, Lu et al., 2019). Traditionally, hydrologists assume that the root zone storage is a
- 94 function of plant available moisture and rooting depth (Yang et al., 2016). This approach considers
- 95 plant available moisture and rooting depth as the independent variables, and root zone storage as-
- 96 the dependent variable. But it is the opposite. Plant available moisture and rooting depth are a-
- 97 function of root zone storage, given some environmental constraints such as soil type and soil-
- 98 depth. Obtaining the detailed spatio-temporal root and soil information at a global scale is-
- 99 virtually impossible (Or, 2019), but fortunately not necessary.
- 100 It is not the soil that determines the hydrology, it is the interaction between ecosystem and climate.
- 101 The climate provides the driver to the survival strategy of the vegetation. As a result, the
- 102 vegetation develops a rooting strategy, which results in a certain moisture buffering capacity (Gao-
- 103 et al., 2014<u>These theories assume that soil properties are controlling processes such as infiltration</u>,
- 104 <u>drainage, or plant evaporation. But this is the wrong way round. Soil properties are the effect</u>,
- 105 rather than the cause of water movement, which itself, is governed by the behaviour of the
- 106 <u>embedding terrestrial ecosystem.</u>
- 107 We therefore argue in favour of an ecosystem-based approach where the integrated hydrological
- 108 <u>behaviour of an ecosystem is inferred based on its water management strategies needed to survive</u>
- 109 and grow, without relying on internal process descriptions. As we shall see, this is not a

Page 4 of 42

- 110 prohibitive task. The very existence of an ecosystem already provides many indications about its
- 111 <u>ability to manage its water resources.</u>
- 112 This ecosystem-based approach has several beneficial consequences for hydrology. First, it
- 113 provides a physical justification for the development of catchment scale hydrological models that
- 114 directly rely on the external factors that influence terrestrial ecosystems, such as climate,
- 115 topography, lithology, etc. These models would be more realistic than soil-based models because
- 116 <u>based on the correct cause-effect relationships. Moreover, they would be less data demanding and</u>
- 117 simpler, as they would not require soil texture information and detailed description of soil water
- 118 dynamics. Second, it would allow digging into the small scale, if this is deemed necessary,
- 119 exploiting the constraints that are imposed by the behaviour of the larger scale system.
- 120 In the following, we first present the soil-centred hydrological perspective and its limitations
- 121 (Section 2), we then argue that there is limited evidence that soil properties actually matter in
- 122 catchment hydrology (Section 3), next we illustrate our terrestrial ecosystem perspective (Section
- 123 <u>4), and provide an interpretation of why the soil-based modelling tradition has proliferated in</u>
- 124 hydrology (Section 5), finally we illustrate the limitations of our approach (Section 6), and present
- 125 <u>our conclusions (Section 7).</u>

126 2 Limitations in the soil-centred hydrological perspective

127 2.1 Challenges in small-scale theories of soil water dynamics

- 128 It is a deeply rooted perception in hydrology that small-scale soil water dynamics are key in
- 129 determining the integrated catchment behaviour at larger scales such as the partitioning of rainfall
- 130 between evaporation, drainage and storage (Vereecken et al., 2022). For example, soil is assumed
- 131 to control plant evaporation, as plant available water content is often parameterized as a function
- 132 of soil texture (Yang et al., 2016). Processes such as Hortonian overland flow, saturation excess
- 133 overland flow, or percolation are often described in relation to water movement in the unsaturated
- 134 zone, using laboratory-scale matrix flow theory developed by soil physicists.; Wang-Erlandsson et-
- 135 al., 2016). Depending on the soil, this buffer translates in a root depth, extent, density and possibly
- 136 access to deeper groundwater (McCormick-et al., 2021). So, for hydrological modelling it is not-

useful to measure soil characteristics and rooting depth. We do not need to know these dependent variables if we can determine root zone storage directly.

139 **2** The soil-centred hydrological perspective

140 It is a deeply rooted perception in hydrology that soil is key in controlling rainfall-runoff-141 processes (Vereecken et al., 2022). Over a century ago, soil physicists developed the laboratory-142 scale matrix flow theory, which is still widely used in so-called "physically-based" hydrological-143 and land surface models (LSMs) (Brutsaert et al., 2015; Xie et al., 2020). This theory describes 144 flow in porous media based on equations that depend on soil hydraulic properties (e.g. porosity, 145 hydraulic conductivity), which are typically associated to soil texture classes (e.g. clay, loam, -146 sand).). Darcy's law describes matrix flow under saturated conditions through a porous medium 147 under a head gradient. Richards' equation regards matrix flow under unsaturated conditions in the 148 vadose zone, determining water flow direction and velocity. Numerous simplified semi-empirical 149 soil infiltration equations were also derived to simulate the infiltration excess overland flow, such 150 as the Philip and Horton equations (Schoener et al., 2021). The matrix flow in most cases is-151 regarded as a well-established theory, much like classical mechanics. To simulate catchment-152 hydrology, matrix flow equations have been extended to distributed physically-based models, 153 cutting catchments into rectangles or triangle fragments, and using topography to drive soil water-154 movement vertically and laterally (Duffy, 1998; Refsgaard et al., 2022). The water infiltration and-155 vertical redistribution in most land surface models are also based on simplified Richards-156 equations, for example in diffusivity form (Vereecken et al., 2019). These models generally-157 require many space and soil-dependent parameters that require substantial calibration and-158 generally lead to equifinality The matrix flow theory is regarded as well-established, much like 159 classical mechanics. 160 However, by tracerFor a hydrological model to be considered "physically-based", it is generally 161 assumed that it needs to be based on these small-scale theories. Land surface models (LSMs) are 162 strongly based on these matrix flow equations (Freeze and Harlan, 1969; Lawrence et al., 2019), 163 which determine soil water movement vertically and laterally (Duffy, 1996; Refsgaard et al.,

164 2022). Even the representative elementary watershed (REW) approach (Reggiani et al., 1998), a 165 physically based framework that describes catchment scale processes, is based on the integration 166 of small-scale conservation equations developed for porous media. 167 This soil-centred perspective is highly rated in the hydrological community. Some of the most 168 prestigious hydrology awards exemplify the tribute of the hydrological community to this 169 perspective, such as the Henry Darcy medal of hydrological sciences in the European Geosciences 170 Union (EGU), the Robert Horton American Geophysical Union (AGU) hydrological science 171 medal, which are named after two hydrologists that pioneered the soil-centred approach. 172 Tracer field experiments, such as dye and isotope studies, have shown that matrix flow has been 173 scarcelyis rarely observed, simply because a well-prepared homogenous soil under lab conditions-174 does not exist in nature. Most soils contain crevices, preferential channels, and openings that 175 transmit free water quite rapidly to the sub-surface, which is termed as-preferential flow (Beven 176 and Germann, 19822013; McDonnell et al., 2007; Beven, 2018; Zehe et al., 2021). Hence, natural 177 conditions do not resemble well-prepared homogenous soil that can be recreated in a laboratory. 178 To allow for preferential flows, modelers proposed more complicated models, which involved-179 even more free parameters to fit with observations. Unlike matrix flow, which has clear-180 description of water movement in homogenous porous media, it is much more challenging to-181 describe preferential flow by succinct mathematic equations. Although there have been In response 182 to this criticism, soil-water theories have become more complex, allowing for preferential flow, 183 which required even more detailed soil characterizations. These challenges have stimulated the 184 development of dual-continuum, dual-porosity, or dual-permeability modifications (Jarvis et al., 185 2016), most models are still based on matrix flow theory (Weiler, 2017). Because of the extreme 186 complexity of soil preferential flow in nature, it is extremely hard, if not impossible, to develop an 187 accurate model tomodels that describe and predictit, even microscale water movement, at the plot 188 scale. The challenge is exponentially greater when we upscaleupscaling preferential flow from 189 spotplot-scale to hillslope or catchment scales (Davies et al., 2013; Germann, 2014; Or, 2019). 190 However, this increase of model complexity, with more free parameters to calibrate, did not show-191 a clear improvement in 2020). At the simulation of soil moisture, groundwater head, and discharge-Page 7 of 42

192	(Glaserglobal scale, hyper-resolution land surface models, which are deemed necessary to
193	addressing critical water cycle science questions and applications, can have up to 109 unknowns
194	<u>(Wood</u> et al., <u>2019</u>)., <u>2011)!</u>
195	From the beginningits establishment, preferential flow theory was regarded as the main culprit
196	challenging the foundation of "physically-based" hydrological models, but it did not help the
197	model builder. The focus on preferential flow appeared not. This avenue has led to shed light on a
198	solution, but rather made the fog even denser.
199	Both matrix flow and preferential flow-models are based on the <i>a priori</i> assumption-that: <u>require</u>
200	many space and soil-properties are key in describing -dependent parameters that are difficult to
201	measure, that require massive computational resources, and that when calibrated are prone to
202	equifinality. Arguably, the avenue of building more complex models by increasingly detailed
203	representation of soil water movement is a steep one. But is it a necessary one, if the objective is
204	to build a physically-based model of catchment scale hydrological processes. In this study, we
205	question the general validity of this assumption, and ask whether thinking outside of the box of the
206	soil-based modelling framework could promote alternative, perhaps simpler theories, that help-
207	explain the observed patterns of ?
208	2.2 Limitations in the pedotransfer functions approach
209	Soil-centred bottom-up hydrological variability.
210	31_Does soil variability matter in catchment hydrology?
211	3.1 Does soil influence the long-term water budget
212	Globally, based on ERA-5 data (the fifth generation of ECMWF atmospheric reanalysis), annual-
213	average terrestrial precipitation (P) is 745 mm/yr (111 km ³ /yr), of which 440 mm/yr (65.5 km ³ /yr,-
214	60% of P) returns to the atmosphere as evaporation (E), and 305 mm/yr (45.5 km3/yr, 40% of P)-
215	generates runoff (Q) (Figure 1). It is clear that evaporation rather than runoff is the dominant flux-
216	after precipitation.

- 217 For terrestrial evaporation, the total global land area is 145 million km², of which 104 million km²-
- 218 (72%) is vegetated. Of total evaporation (E_{total}), soil evaporation only happens in the topsoil, with Page 8 of 42

219	a limited amount only 6% of $E_{\rm ext}$ (Good et al. 2015) As evaporation from vegetation and ground
217	a mined amount, only 676 of 2666 (6000 et al., 2015). As evaporation from vegetation and ground
220	interception accounts for 27%, transpiration is the largest flux at about 60-70% of E_{total} (Coenders-
221	Gerrits et al., 2014; Lian et al., 2018). An increasing number of studies confirmed that landuse-
222	change, e.g. deforestation and afforestation, significantly alter runoff generation (Fenicia et al.,-
223	2009; Nijzink et al., 2016; Sun et al., 2020). Thus, vegetation, and more correctly the ecosystem,
224	rather than soil, is the determining factor of the global and catchment water balance.
225 226	3.2 Do soil-centred models reproduce observed patterns of hydrological variability?
227	In reductionist thinking the lead paradigm is that "the whole is the sum of the parts" (Sivapalan et-
228	al., 2003). Bottom-up-models are developed on the basis of small laboratory-scale laws, where the
229	assumption is that microscale laws remain valid after upscaling. Due to the difficult-to-
230	measurerely on estimates of soil hydraulic properties (SHPs), such as the water retention
231	characteristics, and unsaturated and saturated hydraulic conductivity, modelers have used. As these
232	properties are difficult to measure at appropriate scales, soil pedotransfer functions (PTFs) to-
233	correlate readily availablehave been developed to express SHPs as a function of more accessible
234	soil properties, such as soil texture (i.e. sand-, silt-, clay- content), organic matter, and bulk density
235	with SHPs ((Figure 1; van Looy et al., 2017; Or, 2019 2020; Haghverdi et al., 2020; Gupta et al.,
236	<u>2021; Hohenbrink et al., 2023</u>).



254 correlates poorly with soil hydraulic properties. Gutmann and Small (2007) have shown that soil 255 textural classes, across a range of climates and vegetation covers, merely explained 5% of the 256 variance of real SHPs. In another study, it was found that 95% of the default soil hydraulic 257 parameters in a state-of-the-art land surface model, largely based on soil textural data, were 258 significantly different from region-specific observations (Kishné et al., 2017). 259 Recent studies showed that in order to achieve more realistic estimates of soil hydraulic properties 260 it is necessary to include information about vegetation or biophysical activity (Or, 2020). For 261 example, Bonetti et al. (2021) proposed soil structure corrections into pedotransfer functions, 262 informed by remote-sensing vegetation metrics and local soil texture. Additional studies 263 "rebalance" the soil texture information and highlight the importance of soil structure, originated 264 by soil biophysical activity (Or, 2020; Fatichi et al., 2020). Not only the "physically-based" 265 models, but also the empirical soil-based models, for example the soil conservation service (SCS) 266 method in the SWAT model (soil water assessment tool), involve land-use data to "rebalance" the soil-based curve number in catchment simulations (Arnold et al., 2012). 267 268 Building realistic pedotransfer functions requires detailed characterization of the soil, requiring a 269 large number of parameters that are difficult to estimate. This approach, while feasible for a 270 hillslope or a headwater catchment, becomes impractical at regional or global scales. For 271 hydrological purposes, the ultimate goal is often to determine integrated fluxes of hydrological 272 response at large scales. Hence, it is worth asking: can this integrated behaviour be determined 273 directly from observations, without resorting to small-scale theories and upscaling assumptions? Does soil variability matter in catchment hydrology? 3 274 3.1 Do soil-centred models reproduce hydrological variability? 275 276 A key objective of "physically based" models is to represent hydrological variability, such as 277 spatial patterns of soil moisture, runoff or evaporation. Figure 1.2 is a nicerevealing illustration of 278 how a "physically based" model, making use of that relies on detailed soil information, can make 279 completely wronginconsistent predictions under extreme circumstances (Beekman et al., 2014).

280 On average, these models may function adequately, as almost all hydrological models do under

average conditions, but the example of Figure 1.2 shows how during a relatively extreme drought in The Netherlands the modelled evaporation diverts considerably from observations is unrealistic.

283 The observed top panels in Figure 2 show remote sensing derived evaporation was obtained by

284 interpolation of eddy-covariance and lysimeter observations using ETLook, an energy balance-

based evaporation product (Bastiaanssen et al., 2012). The modelled bottom panels in Figure 2

286 <u>show</u> evaporation was generated by modelled with the dominant Dutch hydrological

287 model<u>Netherlands Hydrological Instrument</u> (NHI) <u>distributed model</u>, which heavily relies on

288 detailed soil maps data. The two methods for estimating evaporation are independent, and

289 soilarguably, the ETLook approach is more realistic, as it is based on eddy-covariance

290 observations. The <u>The comparison is presented for two dry summer months in 2006:</u> June (left

- 291 panel) and July (right panel).
- 292 <u>Two aspects of this comparison are striking. First, in terms of temporal dynamics, ETLook</u>

293 evaporation estimates show an increase in response to increased evaporative demand, whereas the

294 <u>NHI evaporation estimates are decreasing, in response to water stress. Second, in terms of spatial</u>

295 patterns, ETLook estimates are more uniform in response to relatively uniform climatic

296 conditions, whereas NHI estimates are highly variable, mimicking the variability of the soil maps

297 used in the model, which are used to determine plant available storage. The July 2006 picture in

298 the lower partbottom panel, in fact, mimics the soil map. Red (high evaporation) is seen on clay

299 soils and purple (almost no evaporation) on sand.

300 It is funnyinteresting to seeobserve that in realityaccording to ETLook (top right) the forested

301 sandy part at the centre of The Netherlands was evaporating lushly, whereas inaccording to the_

302 <u>hydrological</u> model (bottom right), this ecosystem appeared to be dead. In fact, all<u>Apparently, the</u>

303 ecosystems continued to evaporate well during this July 2006, in spite of the dry month.

304 Apparently, weather conditions. Our interpretation is that the ecosystems had prepared for this

305 eventuality and had created enough root zonerootzone buffer to overcome this period of drought,

306 <u>compensating for the variability of soils</u>.

307 Although such mismatch between distributed model outputs and observedremote sensing

308 monitored patterns are not infrequent, they are typically not regarded as a challenge to the basic 309 model assumptions, but rather, as a problem associated to the uncertainty in model inputs. Hence, 310 such soil-centred hydrological models remain vivid under the hope that "novel, highly resolved 311 soil information at higher resolutions than the grid scale of LSMs may help in better quantifying 312 sub-grid variability of key infiltration parameters" (Vereecken et al., 2022). But is this a realizable





332 seasonality (Figure $\frac{23}{2}$).

333 The soil mayOne the arguments in favour of high resolution distributed models has been their 334 ability of spatial extrapolation, such as capturing the spatial variability of streamflow. Such 335 extrapolation ability cannot be important for small scale (agricultural) hydrology, but this-336 importance is easily overridden achieved by other factors at larger scale, for example climate, 337 topography, vegetation, and geology. All these factors are intertwined, and result in preferential-338 flow not only in the soil profile, but for all hydrological processes at multi-scales (Uhlenbrook, -2006), ranging from fingering, macropores, forest canopy, leaves, roots, fractures, rills and gullies, 339 340 all the way to the river network, and even in the groundwater system (Savenije, 2018). These-341 preferential flow patterns have great influence lumped models that rely on all hydrological-342 processes, including infiltration, percolation, groundwater discharge, and river channel routing 343 (Rodrigues-Iturbe and Rinaldo, 1997; Sivapalan, 2006; Savenije and Hrachowitz, 2017). Theinfiltration capacity, in the absence of vegetation, may be a determining factor for infiltration -344 345 excess overland runoff (Hortonian flow), but this scarcely occurs in natural vegetated landscapes-346 where the ecosystem facilitates infiltration, even in arid regions (Zhao et al., 2019). In mature-347 ecosystems, runoff is dominated by subsurface flow, which is a storage discharge relationship. 348 The preferential flow path, as the connector between small- and large-scale observations, makes-349 the surface, rootzone and ground water systems react to rainfall as an integrated fill and spillsystem (Tromp-van Meerveld and McDonnell, 2006). This allows modellers to merely-350 351 focuscalibration on input-output and storage change, to reproduce the complex rainfall-runoffprocesses through the heterogeneous but fractal patterned surface and subsurface. 352 353 Interestingly, in practice, simplecach individual catchment hydrological models, even without 354 explicitly considering detailed matrix flow or preferential flow, can reproduce complex rainfall-355 runoff processes, with surprisingly good performance. The reliability and robustness of the widely-356 used HBV (Seibert, 2018), GR4J (Perrin et al., 2001), Xinanjiang (Zhao, 1992), and FLEX-357 (Fenicia et al., 2011: Gao et al., 2022), have been tested and validated in a wide range of regional-358 and global hydrological studies (Bergström and Lindström, 2015; Mao and Liu, 2019; Wang et al., 359 2021). There are also. However, there are now several examples of catchment scale distributed

models that describe the observedspatial variability of hydrological signaturesstreamflow without
relying on soil information (e.g. <u>De</u> Boer-Euser et al., 2016; Fenicia et al., 2016; Gao et al., 2019;
Dal Molin et al., 2020; Fenicia et al., 2022). <u>These models are clearly more complex than lumped</u>
models, but not orders of magnitude more complex, as they distribute parameters according to a
small number of landscape units.

Well-predicted, smoothly-varving HS		Торо).		Cli	mat	te					So	oils						V	ege	tatio	on				Ge	olog	gy		
Mean annual discharge -				•	•			•											•	•				•						
Mean winter discharge -					•		•	•												•										
Mean half-flow date -				•		•	•	•	•	•	•	•		•	•					•			0	•	•	•		÷	•	
Q95 (high flow) –				•	•	•	•	•				•				•			•	•						•				
Runoff ratio -				•	•	•	•	•	0		0	•				•			•	•	•		0	•						
Mean summer discharge –				•	•	•	•	•				•								•	•					0				
Baseflow index -		•		•	•	•	•	•	•	٠		•		•	•	•		•	•	•			•		•	•	•		•	•
Q5 (low flow) -				•	•	•	•	•		,	0	•		•	•	•		0	•	•						0				
Frequency of low-flow days -				•		•	•	•	•			•		•					•	•			0			•			•	•
Frequency of high-flow days -					•			•												•	•		0							
Mean duration of high-flow events -						•	•													•										
Mean duration of low-flow events -					•				•																					
Streamflow-precipitation elasticity -		•		•	•	•	•	•		٠	0					•			•				•							•
Slope of the flow _ duration curve						•									•															
No flow frequency -						•	•																0							
Poorly-predicted, abruptly-varying HS	Area	Mean elevation		Mean slope	Seasonality and timing _ of precipitation	Fraction of precipitation _ fallin' as snow	Aridity -	Frequency of high _ precipitation events	Duration of high _	Timing of high _	Timining of low	(Pelletier et al 2016)	Soil depth	Sand fraction -	Silt fraction -	Clay fraction -	Water fraction -	Other fraction -	Forest fraction -	LAI maximum -	Green vegetaion	Frction of dominant	Dominant -	Root depth 50% -	Root depth 99% -	Dominant geological class -	Fraction of dominant _ geological class]	action of carbonate rocks -	Subsurface porosotiy -	Subsurface permeability -
 Spearman rank corr. and hydrological sign 	be	ewte ure (en –]	att	ribut	e							In in	fluei crea	nce ise i	of p in m	red	ictor squ	in th area	ne r d er	ando ror (om f IncN	ores //SE	st:) [%]			ιĽ		
														5	•	15	5 (2	5 (35		4	5		55	5			
-0.5 -0.25		0)		0	.25		0.	5																					

365

Figure 23. Comparison of the influence of catchments attributes and hydrological signatures for
671 U.S. watersheds (from Addor et al., 2018). Large, brightly coloured circles imply strong
correlations and high influence. (Reprinted by permission of John Wiley and Sons).

369 4 Putting the <u>terrestrial</u> ecosystem at the centre of hydrology

370 4.1 Ecosystem hierarchy

- 371 It has been shown that terrestrial ecosystems largely respond to external climate forcing, and to the
- 372 lower boundary conditions determined by topography and lithology (Chapin et al, 2011). With
- 373 time, terrestrial ecosystems organize themselves to make best use of the available solar energy and
- 374 resources. Hence, they adapt to the climate, by developing vegetation types in response to rainfall
- 375 patterns and seasonal temperatures. They also develop the soil given the climate, organisms,
- 376 topography and parental material as suggested by the *clorpt* model (see Section 1).
- 377 Our view, consistent with this perspective, is that an ecosystem adjusts the soil hydraulic
- 378 properties to fulfil specific water management criteria. Hence, understanding the water
- 379 <u>management strategies of the ecosystem is a prerequisite to understanding and modelling soil</u>
- 380 processes. This perspective is opposite to the classical soil-centred hydrological perspective
- 381 presented in Section 2, which sees water fluxes, such as evaporation and drainage, as a function of
- 382 <u>soil properties.</u>
- 383 Figure 4 further illustrates our ecosystem view and how it differs from the classical approach in
- 384 <u>hydrological science. The traditional view is represented by the four isolated circles in the left</u>
- 385 panel of Figure 4. This view assumes that soil plays a central role in governing the terrestrial water
- 386 cycle. In particular, depending on climate forcing, soil hydraulic properties will determine water
- 387 <u>availability for vegetation and water fluxes such as percolation and surface runoff. According to</u>
- 388 this view, the understanding of soil water processes is a prerequisite to simulate vegetation
- 389 dynamics and water fluxes. The circles are isolated from each other, reflecting that in this view
- 390 soil properties, vegetation cover and climate are seen as independent on each other, and can
- 391 influence independently hydrological processes. Indeed, hydrological models typically
- 392 parameterize soil and vegetation independently from each other and from climate forcing.
- 393 Our view is represented by the nested circles in the right panel of Figure 4. Climate sets the
- 394 <u>boundaries for the terrestrial ecosystem, and in turn, the ecosystem manages its water resources,</u>
- 395 determining hydrological processes. Soil hydraulic properties are a function of the ecosystem



- 397 sense that internal circles are dependent on the external ones. The double arrows indicate that
- 398 there are feedbacks between these circles, but the influence of the external circles on the internal
- 399 <u>ones is much greater than vice versa. More specifically, local climate has a strong effect on an</u>
- 400 individual ecosystem, which intentionally adapts to it, developing strategies to grow, survive and
- 401 reproduce. In turn, an individual ecosystem cannot change the local climate significantly
- 402 according to its needs. Hence, the feedback of an ecosystem on the climate is smaller and less
- 403 <u>"intentional" than the effect that the climate exerts on an ecosystem. Similarly, the control that the</u>
- 404 <u>terrestrial ecosystem exerts on soil hydraulic properties, mediated by its water management</u>
- 405 strategies, is much greater and purposeful than the control of the soil on the embedding ecosystem.
- 406 In our perspective, such hierarchy and interactions can reduce rather than add complexity and
- 407 <u>facilitate hydrological process understanding and modelling. For example, it provides a</u>
- 408 justification for the level of detail of catchment models. In many applications of catchment
- 409 hydrology, the 'ecosystem circle' represents the necessary level of detail, and as the effect of soil
- 410 on the ecosystem is rather minor, it is unnecessary to dig into what happens within the 'soil water
- 411 <u>circle'.</u>



- 413 Figure 4. The isolated circles (left) represent the traditional soil-centred hydrological perspective.
- 414 The nested circles (right) represent our view of ecosystem hierarchy and cause-effect

415 <u>relationships.</u>

416 **4.14.2** The ecosystem is the ultimate water manager

417 Engineering hydrologists have a long tradition to focus on runoff generation, which represents at-

418 the same time the most valuable water resources and the cause of water related disasters, i.e.

419 floods and droughts. There is limited realisation that runoff is merely the ecosystem's by-product-

420 of water use (Bonan, 2015), only accounting for 40% of the precipitation, while the ecosystem-

421 evaporates 60% of precipitation back to the atmosphere in its drive to grow and survive.

422 <u>A natural An ecosystem that results from a process of evolution contains traits that are functional</u>

423 to its survival. In this perspective, it is important to understand what the system is trying to

424 achieve in order to explain and predict its behaviour. In the context of hydrology, this approach

425 requires to understand (i) which water management strategies the ecosystem needs to adopt in

426 order to sustain itself and survive, (ii) how hydrological processes, such as interception, surface

427 <u>runoff (or lack thereof)</u>, subsurface stormflow, contribute to satisfy the water needs of the

428 ecosystem, and (iii) which physical characteristics the system needs to demonstrate to enable such

429 processes. This evolutionary perspective considers the structure and internal processes of the

430 ecosystem dependent on its overall behaviour, and it is contrary to the static approach which

431 <u>underlies typical description of soil hydrology, where the system structure is seen as prescribed,</u>

432 <u>and small-scale processes are assumed to determine overall system behaviour.</u>

433 So, what are the water strategies of the ecosystem, and how do they affect its structure and internal

434 <u>hydrological processes? Humans are well aware that water management is critical to their</u>

435 <u>survival. For this reason, they have developed activities for optimum use of water resources such</u>

436 <u>as flood control, water storage, water conservation, river regulation, irrigation, and water</u>

437 <u>treatment. Similarly, a natural ecosystem can only survive if it organizes its water resilience. This</u>

438 In other words, if an ecosystem had not organized its water resilience requires not only, it would

439 <u>not have survived and would no longer exist. The very existence of an ecosystem tells us several</u>

440 <u>aspects of its water management strategies. In particular:</u>

441

• An ecosystem needs to provide sufficient moisture storage in the root zone, torootzone, so

442		that vegetation can overcome critical dry spells, but also sufficient infiltration capacity
443		and subsurface drainage to maintain moisture levels between acceptable boundaries: not
444		too wet and not too dry. If given sufficient time,
445	•	Runoff, the excess water after precipitation has replenished the ecosystem-will improve-
446		the infiltration capacity both's water deficit needs to replenish water in the root zonebe
447		drained as quickly and efficiently as possible.
448	•	Preventing surface runoff is an essential need of an ecosystem, which serves to
449		preventavoid soil erosion. Indeed, surface runoff; is seldom do we observe surface runoff
450		in a natural environment. The ecosystem observed on vegetated hillslopes. It does occur
451		on bare rocks, where there is no vegetation, or on floodplains, where saturation overland
452		flow does not cause significant erosion. Also, it occurs in disturbed ecosystems, such as
453		urbanised areas, roads, paths and ploughed agricultural fields. In rare cases, such as the
454		Loess Plateau in China, the failure of surface runoff prevention caused severe soil erosion
455		at local scale and disastrous sediment deposition and flooding in the lower Yellow River.
456	•	The ecosystem needs to retain nutrients and soil particles and to retain water for plants.
457		For this reason, it creates preferential flow paths that facilitate infiltration in order to-
458		retain nutrients and soil particles and to direct rainfall to where it is most needed.while
459		retaining moisture and nutrients in retention zones. If there is too much infiltrationwater,
460		then sub-surface drainage by preferential excess water bypasses the rootzone where it can
461		recharge and the groundwater or is evacuated through preferential sub-surface drainage
462		patterns on hillslopes evacuates excess water. Preferential flow rapidly delivers the excess
463		water, bypassing the rootzone, to the groundwater system (McDonnell, 2014). By wave-
464		propagation. This type of drainage generates subsurface storm flow and recharges the
465		groundwater head created by the recharge pushes pre-event groundwater to the streams
466		(Kirchner et al., 2003; Hrachowitz et al., 2016; Worthington, 2019) also through-
467		preferential flow patterns (Savenije, 2018). In summary, prevailing preferential flow-
468		paths, mostly as a result of a variety of biological activities, determine rainfall-
469		partitioning and runoff generation, moving beyond plot-scale heterogeneity and process Page 20 of 42

470 complexity, where landscape and ecosystem are the determining factors rathersystem. 471 Ecosystems will generally avoid catastrophic events such as death from drought, 472 temperature stress, landslides, windthrows or fires. If such disruptive events occur, it is 473 generally at time scales longer than the soil. ecosystem memory. If disturbances occur 474 more frequently, ecosystem generally develop resilience to them, such as in the case of 475 frequent fire, where ecosystems can develop fire resistant species, or vegetation that can 476 recover biomass more quickly (Chapin et al., 2011). 477 Modelers utilizing a bottom-up approach also noticed that the simple paradigm of using soil-478 texture as a main predictor of SHPs is problematic (Bonetti et al., 2021). Gutmann and Small-479 (2007) have shown that soil textural classes, across a range of climates and vegetation covers, merely explained 5% of the variance obtained from the real SHPs. It was found that 95% of the-480 481 default soil parameters in a state-of-the-art landsurface model were significantly different fromregion-specific observations (Kishné et al., 2017).-482 483 With the biased observation and the scale effect, modelers need to recalibrate numerous free-484 parameters. There are studies that "rebalance" the soil texture information and highlight the 485 importance of soil structure, originated by soil biophysical activity (Or, 2019; Fatichi et al., 2020). 486 These models do not directly use field measurements of the soil, but "rebalance" the observed soil-487 texture and translate it to soil structure by vegetation indices, e.g. the aboveground vegetation 488 biomass and leaf area index (LAI) (Bonetti et al., 2021). Involving vegetation cover and 489 productivity prominently improved the hydrologic response with respect to runoff generation,-490 infiltration and drainage (Or, 2019). Not only the physically based models, but also the empirical-491 soil-based models, for example the soil conservation service (SCS) method in SWAT model (soil-492 water assessment tool), also involve landuse data to "rebalance" the soil-based curve number in-493 catchment simulation Considering hydrological processes in the context of their purpose from an 494 ecosystem perspective can clarify cause-effect relationships and therefore help their conceptualization and modelling. For example, it can constrain plausible values of SHPs, which 495 496 can be determined based on considerations about overall system behaviour.

497 (Arnold et al., 2012).

498 **4.24.3** The rootzone is the key element in hydrology not the soil

499 Vegetation as a living organism optimizes its rootzone water storage to stabilize water supply at

500 minimal carbon cost, and sometimes access to the deeper groundwater, to cater for periods of

501 drought (Gao et al., 2014; McCormick et al., 2021). From a hydrology perspective, the From a

502 <u>catchment hydrology perspective, a key objective is to determine the partitioning of precipitation</u>

503 <u>between evaporation, drainage and storage. This partitioning mostly takes place in the rootzone.</u>

504 <u>The</u> vertical profile of the critical zone can be divided into different layers, i.e.: canopy, litter

505 layer, root zonerootzone, water transition zone, unconfined groundwater, and confined

506 groundwater. The most active layers in the critical zone defining rainfall partitioning and related

507 hydrological processes include: The most significant phase change of water happens in the

508 canopy, litter layer, and root zone.rootzone. Once water overtakes these zones, evaporation is

509 relatively small and water is routed to the stream through various pathways. Globally, the

510 vegetation interception storage capacity of terrestrial ecosystems is about 1-2 mm, <u>as</u> estimated by

511 remotes<u>remote</u> sensing<u>-based</u> LAI data (De Roo et al., 1996). The litter layer storage capacity

512 differs in differentamong ecosystems, but it is likely to increase the total interception storage

513 capacity to around 2-5 mm (Shi et al., 2004). For determining the; Gerrits et al., 2010). Global

514 <u>average</u> rootzone storage capacity of ecosystems, the mass curve technique appeared to work well-

515 locallyin vegetated regions is about 146-242 mm, as estimated by multiple approaches and

516 globally (Gao et al., 2014<u>datasets (Kleidon, 2004;</u> Wang-Erlandsson et al., 2016) whereby use was

517 made of ERA-5 evaporation data to estimate, resulting in a global average root zone storage

518 capacity of 228 mm (Figure 3). Hence, rootzone storage capacity2016), which is significantly

519 larger than interception and litter layer water storage capacities. Beneath the rootzone, water in the

520 transition zone between root zone and groundwater and the unconfined groundwater does not have

521 phase changes, and will be discharged as runoff under natural condition. The deep confined

522 groundwater has a very long transit time, without much connection to surface processes, and is not

523 considered in surface runoff calculation in most cases. Hence, the root zone storage plays the

524 dominant role in catchment hydrology, determining how catchments respond to rainfall.

- 525 <u>Therefore, the rootzone storage is the one with the longest memory, which influence how much</u>
- 526 precipitation eventually becomes streamflow.
- 527 <u>Referring to common hydrological models, the rootzone storage can be assimilated to the</u>
- 528 <u>"production" reservoir in the GR4J model (Perrin et al., 2003), the "upper zone" reservoir in HBV</u>
- 529 (Lindström et al., 1997), the "tension water" storage in Xinanjiang model (Zhao, 1992), or the
- 530 <u>"soil moisture" storage in probability distributed model (PDM) (Moore, 2007). In these models,</u>
- 531 the size of this reservoir is typically obtained by calibration. This approach is clearly
- 532 <u>unsatisfactory from a theoretical point of view as it makes these models not predictive under</u>
- 533 <u>environmental change.</u>
- 534 From a soil-based perspective, the rootzone storage is commonly estimated as a function of plant
- 535 available moisture and rooting depth (Yang et al., 2016). In our view, this approach is also not
- 536 satisfactory, as it considers plant available moisture and rooting depth as independent variables,
- 537 and rootzone storage as the dependent variable. We argue the reverse: plant available moisture and
- 538 rooting depth are a function of the rootzone storage that is created by the ecosystem to fulfil its
- 539 water management strategies. Moreover, the classical approach is impractical, as obtaining the
- 540 detailed spatio-temporal root and soil information at a global scale is virtually impossible (Or,
- 541 <u>2020).</u>
- 542 So, how to determine rootzone storage without resorting to calibration, or in situ measurements?
- 543 As mentioned in the previous section, our ecosystem approach would start with understanding the
- 544 <u>ecosystem water management strategies, and using this understanding to figure out how the</u>
- 545 <u>ecosystem needs to organize its internal behaviour. Vegetation will try to maintain evaporation</u>
- 546 close to potential to maximise net carbon profit. It will therefore optimize its rootzone water
- 547 storage so that it is sufficiently large to overcome typical dry spells, much like humans size dams
- 548 to sustain droughts (Gao et al., 2014). An approach that appeared to work well locally and globally
- 549 for estimating the rootzone storage capacity is the mass curve technique, originally developed for
- 550 reservoir design at an acceptable probability of failure (Gao et al., 2014; Wang-Erlandsson et al.,
- 551 <u>2016</u>). Here the supply is represented by precipitation, and the demand by potential evaporation.
- 552 This technique is uniquely based on climate data. This technique has an important benefit over

approaches based on calibration or field observations: it can also be used to describe how the
rootzone would evolve in response to climate change.

555 It is worthwhile noting that rootzone and soil have a strong connection, but are essentially

556 different things. The soil profile can reach over hundreds of meters² depth, e.g. the Loess Plateau

- 557 in China (Zhang et al., 2014), of which only the rootzone is the active area, whereby the soil is
- 558 merely the substrate of it. Rootzone storage can also be larger than soil water storage, for example
- 559 in karst mountainous areas where soil is thin and discontinuous, bedrock storage serves as an
- 560 important source of plant-available water (McCormick et al., 2021). Rootzone water storage is a-

561 more accurate term in hydrology, which cannot be measured directly, but with clear physical-

562 meaning, similar to the runoff depth and runoff efficiency. In very dry climates, roots can even

563 reach the deep groundwater, thus in this case, the rootzone also includes some part of the

564 groundwater (see Singh et al., 2020). In cold regions, it is necessary to take account of snowmelt

565 and soil freeze/thaw processes on rootzone water storage and resulting hydrologic connectivity

566 (Gao et al., 2020; 2022). In cropland, where irrigation provides an extra water supply to rootzone

567 <u>during dry seasons, the rootzone water storage capacity is often smaller than under natural</u>

568 <u>conditions with similar climate conditions (Xi et al., 2021).</u>



569

570 Figure 3. The importance of root zone storage capacity in catchment hydrology. All the numbers-

571 are global average values in vegetated area, obtained by ERA-5 data from 1980 to 2020.

572 4.34.4 Landscape-based model: the giant view of hydrology

573 A soil-based model <u>of catchment scale processes</u> is like <u>anthe</u> ant's perspective, observing a

- 574 complex world of heterogeneities and randomness- (Savenije, 2010). According to this
- 575 perspective, small-scale processes are the basis for integrated system behaviour. As a result, a

576 model can be "physically-based" only if it relies on small scale physics.

577 Seeing the patterns of hillslope, landscape and catchment is rather the giant's perspective, as these

578 patterns only become visible when we zoom out well beyond the microscale of the soil or the

579 <u>human scale (Savenije, 2010; Gao et al., 2018).</u> Landscape, as the integration of topography and

580 landcover, beingis seen as the long-term co-evolution of ecosystem, atmosphere, lithosphere,

581 pedosphere, hydrosphere, and human activities (Mücher et al., 2010; Wu, 2013; Troch et al., 2015)

582 is rather the giant's). According to this perspective (Savenije, 2010). The pattern of hillslope,

583 landscape and catchment only becomes visible when we zoom out well beyond the microscale of-

the soil or the human, a "physically-based" model needs to be based on large-scale, for that matter

585 <u>system behaviour</u>.

586 AtBoth approaches can produce models that provide good results. However, in our perspective,

587 for catchment hydrology applications it is the giant's perspective that wins. First, the giant's

588 model captures the right cause-effect relationships, and is therefore more satisfactory from a

589 theoretical point of view. For example, it is a tool to test how an ecosystem would adapt to

590 <u>changes in climatic drivers. Second, landscape-based catchment models will generally be simpler</u>

591 than fragmented catchment models, as natural system exhibits emergent properties, which

592 <u>effectively enable a description of large-scale, hydrological laws can be</u><u>processes independent</u>

593 on what happens at the smaller scale. Such emergent properties are often characterized by simple:

594 <u>laws, such as</u> the fill and spill bucket model with thresholds and associated time scales

595 (McDonnell et al., 2021), and the linear reservoir for groundwater are physically sound at

596 hillslope and catchment scale (Savenije, 2010; Fenicia et al., 2011; Savenije and Hrachowitz,

597 2017). Landscape-based models also use conservation of mass and energy, but momentum transfer

598 is made of conceptual relations that relate discharge to storage using landscape and ecosystem-

599 characteristics, such as travel times and a probability function for runoff thresholds. Geology as

600 the substrates of hydrological processes also plays an important role on slow processes.

601 Interestingly, the underground hydrogeologygroundwater system seems also appears to be self-

602 organized and structured (Savenije, 2018). For example, the recession parameter k is around 4345

days in worldwide catchments regardless of their climate, topography, soil, and geology (Brutsaert-

Page 25 of 42

and Sugita, 2008). Discovering these properties and related signatures benefit our understanding
and prediction of the dynamic adaption of ecosystems to environmental change, and the
subsequent impacts on hydrology (Gharari et al., 2014; Jackisch et al., 2021).

607 Explosive growth of remote sensing technology and powerful geographic information system-

608 (GIS) toolkits provide unprecedented opportunities, with a giant's view, to closely read landscapes-

609 and monitor their hydrological components in high spatial and temporal resolutions (Duan et al.,-

610 2021; Crow et al. 2022). Various measurement techniques, e.g. eddy covariance, make it possible-

611 to quantify the mass and energy budget at landscape scale (Jung et al., 2020; Lan et al., 2021). The

612 GRACE satellite provides independent estimates of moisture storage on Earth (Famiglietti et al.,

613 2015; Dong et al., 2022). These datasets form crucial complementary information to constrain-

614 landscape-based model parameters, validate the internal fluxes, and eventually give more-

615 physically-based and reliable simulation (Winsemius et al., 2006; Nijzink et al., 2018; Gao et al.,

616 2020).

617 <u>This ecosystem perspective provides a physical justification for catchment scale models that do</u>

618 not rely on small scale physics, as they are independent on what happens at the smaller scale.

619 Moreover, they can provide a constraint to smaller scale processes, and therefore facilitate their

620 representation. For example, the partitioning of water between evaporation, storage and release

621 that characterize the larger scale system can be used to constrain plausible values of difficult to

622 measure soil properties such as rooting depth, plant available moisture and hydraulic conductivity.

623 <u>This can favour more accurate descriptions of soil water dynamics, which, although often</u>

624 <u>unnecessary for typical catchment scale applications, can may be important for other purposes.</u>

625 4.5 Proposed modelling steps in poorly gauged catchments

626 <u>How can this approach be implemented in modelling an ungauged catchment? There are the</u>

627 <u>following steps to be considered as a quick guide to model building.</u>

628 The first thing is to classify the basin on landscape and geology. This determines model structure.

629 It defines the proportion between the major three fast runoff mechanisms: rapid subsurface flow

630 (for Hillslope), saturation overland flow (for Wetland) and Hortonian overland flow (for Plateau,

- 631 <u>bare rock</u>). Theory and application of landscape-based modelling are presented in (Savenije, 2010;
- 632 Gharari et al., 2011, Fenicia et al., 2011; Gao et al., 2014, 2018; De Boer-Euser et al., 2016;
- 633 <u>Hulsman et al., 2021a; Bouaziz et al., 2022).</u>
- 634 <u>Subsequently classify landscape units on ecosystem, land use and climate. The climate and the</u>
- 635 <u>ecosystem determine hydrological parameters such as rootzone storage, interception capacity,</u>
- 636 infiltration capacity and subsurface drainage. Spatial variability of rootzone storage determines the
- 637 Beta function of the non-linear rootzone reservoir (Gao et al., 2018). This results in hydrological
- 638 response units based on landscape and geology (defining model structure), ecosystem and climate
- 639 (defining parameter values), which can be grouped per sub-basin.
- 640 <u>Recession time scales can be derived from limited observations, if available, or otherwise</u>
- 641 estimated; they do not affect the overall water balance. The longer time scales of groundwater
- 642 recession may be derived from Gravity Recovery and Climate Experiment (GRACE) data, which
- 643 can also be used to constrain groundwater dynamics (Winsemius et al., 2006; Hulsman et al.,
- 644 <u>2021b).</u>
- 645 <u>Minor calibration parameters remain, such as the splitter between fast subsurface runoff and</u>
- 646 <u>recharge. These have a limited effect on the water balance and can be estimated if no observations</u>
 647 are available.

5 Why is the soil-based modelling tradition so rooted in

- 649 hydrology?
- 650 Occam's razor tells us "Entities are not to be multiplied beyond necessity". This principle gives-
- 651 precedence to simplicity: of two competing theories, the simpler explanation of an entity is to be-
- 652 preferred. Therefore, if soil does not play a significant role neither in the water balance nor in-
- 653 rainfall-runoff processes, and if disregarding soil does not significantly affect model performance,-
- 654 there is sufficient and fair reason to exclude soil properties in hydrological modelling. But then:-
- 655 why are soil-based models so rooted in hydrology?-

656 **5.1 Agricultural bias**

657 Since hydrology was born from chapters of agricultural and hydraulics textbooks (Rodríguez-658 Iturbe and Rinaldo, 2004), the misunderstanding that soils are the determining factor in hydrologyis probably caused by the "agricultural bias"- has probably played a major role in overemphasizing 659 660 the importance of soils. In agriculture, the focus is on seasonal crops. A seasonal crop has limited 661 time to develop a root zone root zone storage that can buffer for longer term variability. At best, it 662 can buffer for average dry spells that may occur within an average year. This is why modern 663 agriculture requires water management by the farmer to buffer for natural fluctuations. In 664 agriculture, ploughing destroys preferential infiltration and sub-surface drainage. It also limits the 665 root zonerootzone storage capacity to the relatively small soil layer above the plough pan. In such 666 cases it is indeed the moisture holding capacity of the soil that determines the root zonerootzone 667 storage capacity.

668 As regards evaporation, it occurs in many ways: by transpiration, direct evaporation from leaf and

669 ground interception, bare soil evaporation, open water evaporation, sublimation, and in general-

670 from all phase changes where liquid or solid water turns into vapour. All these mechanisms obey-

671 different constraints and need to be modelled separately to arrive at a correct representation of

672 total evaporation. In that respect, the dominant <u>The</u> widely used Penman-Monteith equation, so-

673 successful for estimating reference evaporation works well in agriculture, where the dominant

674 <u>evaporation is from crops. However, it is likely not appropriate to describe land-atmosphere</u>

675 interaction-<u>of natural ecosystems.</u> Unfortunately, this "agricultural bias"<u>only applicable in small</u>

676 <u>proportion of terrestrial area</u> has been dominant in most hydrological work. We argue that this

677 deeply rooted soil-based perception may limit or even mislead the further development of

678 hydrological science, especially for next generation professionals.

679 Even in the Anthropocene, where human impacts on essential planetary processes have become

680 profound, and hydrological processes are affected by human activities such as agriculture,

681 <u>urbanization and deforestation, we believe it is still essential to emphasize the importance of</u>

- 682 <u>ecosystem understanding. There are two reasons: 1) the majority of our earth, and particularly the</u>
- 683 uphill runoff generating parts of catchments, is still dominated by natural ecosystems, although

684	human modification has modified 14.5% or 18.5 M km ² of land (Theobald et al., 2020), and 2)
685	also for human modified systems the ecological approach applies, provided that the ecosystem is
686	given sufficient time to become self-sufficient and manage its own resources.

687 **5.2 Unreliable intuition**

Hydrologists intuitively concern about see the soil- as the critical agent. It couldmay very well by the perspective of the ant that causes it. As people, we are biased by our perspective and the scale at which we observe processes. We are therefore just too small to observe perceive the larger scale processes that dominate landscape hydrology. We tend to dig holes in the Earth and try to infer larger scale behaviour from what we observe inside this hole. The human scale prevents us from seeing the larger picture. We need the giant's perspective to recognise the patterns present in the landscape.-

695 At the human scale, assuming that soil properties, such as texture and porosity, matter makes 696 intuitive sense. People tend to describe what they see (i.e. the consequence) rather than the cause, 697 and if they see water flowing or disappearing in the ground they think that it is because of such 698 soil properties. The role of the ecosystem as the driver of the system is much more difficult to 699 recognize, because it is hidden to the eye.especially within its evolutionary history. It requires 700 seeing the environment as a living thingorganism, which continuously evolves and adjusts to 701 changing circumstances. It also implies that the hydrological properties are not constant over time. 702 The root zonerootzone storage, the most critical control on rainfall-runoff processes, is 703 continuously changing in response to changing climatic and human drivers- (Nijzink et al., 2016; 704 Bouaziz et al., 2022). Instead of describing the 'now' as an invariant and static condition, with 705 environmental properties as a given, one has we have to think of the history that determined these 706 environmental conditions, which is much more difficult to realise.

- 707 6 Conclusion
- 708 6 Hydrology is the blood stream of the Limitations

 709 We stress that our ecosystem. Runoff is merely _ approach is subject to certain limitations. First, it
 710 applies at the so-called ecosystem scale. This spatial scale can vary depending on the environment. Page 29 of 42 711 It can be a few square meters for grass, in the excessorder or hectares for forest, even larger for

712 sparse vegetation. Catchment scales are usually larger than the ecosystem scale. Therefore, our

713 approach is generally suited for scales that are typical in hydrological modelling application.

714 <u>Second, we are talking about ecosystems that have reached a certain level of equilibrium and are</u>

715 self-sustained. We are not limiting ourselves to natural ecosystem. They can also be artificially

716 induced. But they do not need to rely on artificial help for their survival, such as irrigation or

717 <u>fertilization. Third, our arguments are mostly related to</u> water after precipitation has replenished

718 ecosystem's fluxes, and they do not pertain to water deficit. chemistry. The variability of soils can

719 <u>have a pronounced influence on predicting water quality, solute transport, and transit times (Weiler</u>

720 <u>et al., 2017; Sternagel et al., 2021).</u>

721 **<u>7</u>** Conclusions

Traditional "physically-based" models puthydrological theories place soil physical properties at
 the heart of hydrology, considering them as the driver of water fluxes, which is misleading for

both process understanding and model development. In contrast we need an ecosystem-centred-

725 approach. Nowadays there is much concern about the Critical Zone of the Earthbased approach,

726 where virtually all life takes place. The the structure of the terrestrial ecosystem and its internal

727 processes are seen as a consequence of ecosystem water management strategies needed for its

728 survival and growth. Hence, the ecosystem is the ultimate manager of the critical zone, with-

729 hydrology as its blood stream.soil. We advocate a paradigm shift to putchange in perspective that

730 places the ecosystem and landscape at the heart of terrestrial hydrology, and develop holistic and

alive ecosystem-based hydrological models, with <u>bettera more realistic</u> representation of

732 hydrological processes in Earth system science.

733

734 Acknowledgement: This research has been supported by the National Natural Science

Foundation of China (grant nos. 42122002, 42071081). We are grateful to Adriaan J. (Ryan)

736 <u>Teuling, Luca Brocca, Conrad Jackisch, and one anonymous referee, for their constructive and</u>

737 detailed comments and suggestions, which have been greatly helpful for sharpening the message

Page 30 of 42

738 and improving the flow of arguments.

739

- 740 <u>Code/Data availability: No code or data sets were used in this article.</u>
- 741 Author contribution: Three authors contributed equally to this work, including
- 742 <u>conceptualization, writing, and revision.</u>
- 743 Competing interests: At least one of the (co-)authors is a member of the editorial board of
- 744 <u>Hydrology and Earth System Sciences. The peer-review process was guided by an independent</u>
- 745 editor, and the authors have also no other competing interests to declare.

746 **References**

Addor, N., Nearing, G., Prieto, C., Newman, A.-J., Le Vine, N., and Clark, M.-P.: A ranking of

hydrological signatures based on their predictability in space, Water Resour. Res., 54, 8792–8812,
https://doi.org/10.1029/2018WR022606, 2018.

- 750 Arnold, J.<u>G</u>., Moriasi, D.<u>N</u>., Gassman, P.<u>W</u>., Abbaspour, K.<u>C</u>., White, M.J., Srinivasan, R., Santhi,
- 751 C., Harmel, R., van.D., Van Griensven, A., Van Liew, M<u>.W</u>., Kannan, N., and Jha, M<u>.K</u>.: SWAT:
- 752 Model use, calibration, and validation, Trans. ASABE, 55, 1491–1508,
- 753 https://doi.org/10.13031/2013.42256, 2012.
- 754 Banwart, S<u>.A</u>., Bernasconi, S<u>.M</u>., Blum, W., E.H., de Souza, D.-M. de, . Chabaux, F., Duffy, C.,
- 755 Kercheva, M., Krám, P., Lair, G.-J., Lundin, L., Menon, M., Nikolaidis, N., Novak, M., Panagos,
- P., Ragnarsdottir, K<u>.V.</u>, Robinson, D<u>.A</u>., Rousseva, S., <u>de</u>Ruiter, P., <u>van</u> Gaans, P., <u>Weng, L.</u>,
- 757 <u>White, T.,</u> and Zhang, B.: Soil functions in Earth's critical zone: Key results and conclusions, Adv.
- 758 Agron., 142, 1–27, https://doi.org/10.1016/bs.agron.2016.11.001, 2017.
- 759 Bastiaanssen, W. G. M., Cheema, M. J. M., Immerzeel, W. W., Miltenburg, I. J., and Pelgrum, H.,
- 760 Surface energy balance and actual evapotranspiration of the transboundary Indus Basin estimated
- 761 from satellite measurements and the ETLook model, Water Resour. Res., 48, W11512,
- 762 <u>doi:10.1029/2011WR010482, 2012</u>
- 763 Beekman, W., Caljé, R., Schaars, F., and Heijkers, J.: Vergelijking van enkele schattingsmethoden
- voor de actuele verdamping (Comparison between several methods to estimate actual
- 765 evaporation), Stromingen, 20, 39–46, 2014.
- 766 Bergström, S. and Lindström, G.: Interpretation of runoff processes in hydrological modelling
- 767 experience from the HBV approach, Hydrol. Process., 29, 3535–3545,

Page $31\ {\rm of}\ 42$

- 768 https://doi.org/10.1002/hyp.10510, 2015.
- 769 Beven, K. and Germann, P.: Macropores and water flow in soils revisited, Water Resour. Res., 18,-
- 770 1311 1325, https://doi.org/10.1029/WR018i005p01311, 1982.49, 3071-3092,
- 771 <u>https://doi.org/10.1002/wrcr.20156, 2013.</u>
- 772 Beven, K.: A century of denial: Preferential and nonequilibrium water flow in soils, 1864–1984.,
- 773 Vadose Zone J., 17, <u>1801531-17</u>, https://doi.org/10.2136/vzj2018.08.0153, 2018.
- 774 Blöschl, G. and Sivapalan, M.: Scale issues in hydrological modelling: A review, Hydrol. Process.,
- 775 9, 251 290, https://doi.org/10.1002/hyp.3360090305, 1995.
- 776 Bonan, G. B. Ecological climatology concepts and applications, 3rd edition, Cambridge-
- 777 University Press, https://doi.org/10.1017/CBO9781107339200, 2015.
- 778 Bonetti, S., Wei, Z., and Or, D.: A framework for quantifying hydrologic effects of soil structure
- across scales, Commun. Earth Environ., 2, 107, https://doi.org/10.1038/s43247-021-00180-0,
 2021.
- 781 Bouaziz, L.J.E., Aalbers, E., Weerts, A.H., Hegnauer, M., Buiteveld, H., Lammersen, R., Stam, J.,

Sprokkereef, E., Savenije, H.H.G., and Hrachowitz, M.: Ecosystem adaptation to climate change:
the sensitivity of hydrological predictions to time-dynamic model parameters, Hydrol. Earth Syst.
Sci., Bouma, J., Bonfante, A., Basile, A., van Tol, J., Hack-ten Broeke, M.26, 1295–1318,

- 785 <u>https://doi.org/10.5194/hess-26-1295-2022, 2022.</u>
- 786 -J.-D., Mulder, M., Heinen, M., Rossiter, D. G., Poggio, L., and Hirmas, D. R.: How can pedology
- 787 and soil classification contribute towards sustainable development as a data source and

788 information carrier?, Geoderma, 424, 115988, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.geoderma.2022.115988, 789 2022.

- 790 Brutsaert, W. and Hiyama, T.: The determination of permafrost thawingLong-term groundwater
- 791 storage trends estimated from long-term streamflow measurements with an application in eastern-
- 792 Siberia, J. Geophys. Res.-Atmos., 117, 1–10, https://doi.org/10.1029/2012JD018344, 2012.
- 793 Brutsaert, W. Hydrology: An Introduction, Cambridge University Press, https://doi.org/-
- 794 10.1017/CBO9780511808470, 2005.
- 795 Coenders-Gerrits, M., Van der Ent, R., Bogaard, T., Wang-Erlandsson, L., records: Climatic
- perspectiveHrachowitz, M., and Savenije, H.: Uncertainties in transpiration estimates, Nature,
 506, E1-2, https://doi.org/10.1038/nature12925, 2014.
- 798 Crow, W. T., Dong, J., and Reichle, R. H.: Leveraging pre-storm soil moisture estimates for
- 799 enhanced land surface model calibration in ungauged hydrologic basins, Water Resour. Res., 58,
- 800 e2021WR031565, https://44, W02409, doi.org/:10.1029/2021WR031565, 20222007WR006518,

801	<u>2008</u> .
802 803	Chapin, F.S., III, Matson, P.A., Vitousek, P., and Chapin, M.C.: Principles of Terrestrial Ecosystem Ecology, Second edn, Springer, https://doi.org/10.1007/978-1-4419-9504-9, 2011.
804 805 806 807	Dal Molin, M., Schirmer, M., Zappa, M., and Fenicia, F.: Understanding dominant controls on streamflow spatial variability to set up a semi-distributed hydrological model: the case study of the Thur catchment, Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci., 24, 1319–1345, https://doi.org/10.5194/hess-24-1319-2020, 2020.
808 809 810	Davies, J., Beven, K., Rodhe, A., Nyberg, L., and Bishop, K.: Integrated modeling of flow and residence times at the catchment scale with multiple interacting pathways, Water Resour. Res., 49, 4738–4750, https://doi.org/10.1002/wrcr.20377, 2013.
811 812 813	deDe Boer-Euser, T., McMillan, HK., Hrachowitz, M., Winsemius, HC., and Savenije, HHG.: Influence of soil and climate on root zonerootzone storage capacity, Water Resour. Res., 52, 2009–2024, https://doi.org/10.1002/2015WR018115, 2016.
814 815 816 817	De Roo, A. P. J., Wesseling, C. G., and Ritsema, C. J: LISEM: A Single-event Physically Based Hydrological and Soil Erosion Model for Drainage Basins. I: Theory, Input and Output, Hydrol. Process., 10, 1107–1117, https://doi.org/10.1002/(SICI)1099-1085(199608)10:8<1107::AID- HYP415>3.0.CO;2-4, 1996.
818 819 820 821	Domeignoz-Horta, L. A., Shinfuku, M., Junier, P., Poirier, S., Verrecchia, E., Sebag, D., and DeAngelis, K. M.: Direct evidence for the role of microbial community composition in the formation of soil organic matter composition and persistence, ISME Commun., 1, 64, https://doi.org/10.1038/s43705-021-00071-7, 2021.
822 823 824 825	Dong, N., Wei, J., Yang, M., Yan, D., Yang, C., Gao, H., Arnault, J., Laux, P., Zhang, X., Liu, Y., Niu, J., Wang, H., Wang, H., Kunstmann, H., and Yu, Z.: Model estimates of China's terrestrial- water storage variation due to reservoir operation, Water Resour. Res., 58, e2021WR031787, https://doi.org/10.1029/2021WR031787, 2022.
826 827	Drewniak, B. A.: Simulating dynamic roots in the energy Exascale Earth system land model, J. Adv. Model. Earth Syst., 11, 338–359, https://doi.org/10.1029/2018MS001334, 2019.
828 829 830	Duan, Z., Duggan, E., Chen, C., Gao, H., Dong, J., and Liu, J.: Comparison of traditional method- and triple collocation analysis for evaluation of multiple gridded precipitation products across- Germany, J. Hydrometeorol., 22, 2983–2999, https://doi.org/10.1175/JHM-D-21-0049.1, 2021.
831 832 833	Duffy, C <u>.J</u> .: A two-state integral-balance model for soil moisture and groundwater dynamics in complex terrain, Water Resour. Res., 32, 2421–2434, https://doi.org/10.1029/96WR01049, 1996.
I	Page 33 of 42

- 834 provide the big picture, Science, 349, 684–685, https://doi.org/10.1126/science.aac9238, 2015.
- 835 Fatichi, S., Or, D., Walko, R., Vereecken, H., Young, M. H., Ghezzehei, T. A., Hengl, T., Kollet, S.,
- 836 Agam, N., and Avissar, R.: Soil structure is an important omission in Earth System Models, Nat.
- 837 Commun., 11, 522, https://doi.org/10.1038/s41467-020-14411-z, 2020.
- 838 Fenicia, F., Kavetski, D., and Savenije, H. H. G.: Elements of a flexible approach for conceptual
- hydrological modeling: 1. Motivation and theoretical development, Water Resour. Res., 47,
- 840 W11510, https://doi.org/10.1029/2010WR010174, 2011.
- 841 Fenicia, F., Kavetski, D., Savenije, H. H. G., and Pfister, L.: From spatially variable streamflow to
- distributed hydrological models: Analysis of key modeling decisions, Water Resour. Res., 52,
- 843 954–989, https://doi.org/10.1002/2015WR017398, 2016.
- 844 Fenicia, F., Meissner, D., and McDonnell, J. J.: Modeling streamflow variability at the regional
- scale: (2) Development of a bespoke distributed conceptual model, J. Hydrol., 605, 127286,
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jhydrol.2021.127286, 2022.
- 847 Fenicia, F., Savenije, H. H. G., and Avdeeva, Y.: Anomaly in the rainfall-runoff behaviour of the-
- 848 Meuse catchment. Climate, land-use, or land-use management?, Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci., 13, 1727–1737, https://doi.org/10.5194/hess-13-1727-2009, 2009.
- 850 Freeze, R. A. and Harlan, R. L.: Blueprint for a physically-based, digitally-simulated hydrologic
- 851 response model, J. Hydrol., 9, 237–258, https://doi.org/10.1016/0022-1694(69)90020-1, 1969.
- 852 Gao, H., Hrachowitz, M., Schymanski, S. J., Fenicia, F., Sriwongsitanon, N., and Savenije, H. H.
- 853 <u>G.: Climate controls how ecosystems size the rootzone storage capacity at catchment scale</u>,
- 854 <u>Geophys. Res. Lett.</u>, 41, 7916–7923, https://doi.org/10.1002/2014GL061668, 2014.
- 855 Gao, H., Sabo, J. L., Chen, X., Liu, Z., Yang, Z., Ren, Z., and Liu, M.: Landscape heterogeneity
- and hydrological processes: a review of landscape-based hydrological models, Landsc. Ecol., 33,
 1461–1480, https://doi.org/10.1007/s10980-018-0690-4, 2018.
- 858 <u>Gao, H.,</u> Birkel, C., Hrachowitz, M., Tetzlaff, D., Soulsby, C., and Savenije, H. H. G.: A simple
- topography-driven and calibration-free runoff generation module, Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci., 23,
 787–809, https://doi.org/10.5194/hess-23-787-2019, 2019.
- Gao, H., Dong, J., Chen, X., Cai, H., Liu, Z., Jin, Z., Mao, D., Yang, Z., and Duan, Z.: Stepwise
- modeling and the importance of internal variables validation to test model realism in a data scarce
 glacier basin, J. Hydrol., 591, 125457, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jhydrol.2020.125457, 2020.
- Gao, H., Han, C., Chen, R., Feng, Z., Wang, K., Fenicia, F., and Savenije, H. H. G.: Frozen soil
- 865 hydrological modeling for a mountainous catchment northeast of the Qinghai-Tibet Plateau,
- 866 Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci., 26, 4187–4208, https://doi.org/10.5194/hess-26-4187-2022, 2022.

Page 34 of 42

- 867 Gao, H., Hrachowitz, M., Schymanski, S. J., Fenicia, F., Sriwongsitanon, N., and Savenije, H. H.-
- 868 G-: Climate controls how ecosystems size the root zone-storage capacity at eatchment seale,
- 869 Geophys. Res. Lett., 41, 7916-7923, https://doi.org/10.1002/2014GL061668, 2014.
- 870 Gao, H., Sabo, J. L., Chen, X., Liu, Z., Yang, Z., Ren, Z., and Liu, M.: Landscape heterogeneity-
- 871 and hydrological processes: a review of landscape-based hydrological models, Landse. Ecol., 33,
- 872 1461–1480, https://doi.org/10.1007/s10980-018-0690-4, 2018-
- 873 Germann, P. F.: Preferential flow: Stokes approach to infiltation and drainage, Geographica
- 874 Bernensia, Bern, Switzerland, ISBN 978-3-905835-34-2, 2014.
- 875 Gerrits, A. M. J., Pfister, L., and Savenije, H. H. G.: Spatial and temporal variability of canopy and
- 876 <u>forest floor interception in a beech forest, Hydrol. Process., 24, 3011–3025</u>,
- 877 <u>https://doi.org/10.1002/hyp.7712, 2010.</u>
- 878 <u>Gharari, S., Hrachowitz, M., Fenicia, F., and Savenije, H.H.G.: Hydrological landscape</u>
- 879 <u>classification: investigating the performance of HAND based landscape classifications in a central</u>
- 880 European meso-scale catchment, Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci., 15, 3275–3291,
- 881 <u>https://doi.org/10.5194/hess-15-3275-2011, 2011.</u>
- 882 Gharari, S., Hrachowitz, M., Fenicia, F., Gao, H., and Savenije, H. H. G.: Using expert knowledge
- to increase realism in environmental system models can dramatically reduce the need for
- calibration, Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci., 18, 4839–4859, https://doi.org/10.5194/hess-18-4839-2014,
- 885 2014.
- 886 Glaser, B., Jackisch, C., Hopp, LGupta, S., Hengl, T., Lehmann, P., Bonetti, S., and Klaus, J.: How
- 887 meaningful are plot-scale observations and simulationsOr, D.: SoilKsatDB: Global database of
- 888 preferential flowsoil saturated hydraulic conductivity measurements for eatchment models?,-
- 889 Vadose Zone J., 18, 180146 geoscience applications, Earth Syst. Sci. Data, 13, 1593–1612,
- 890 https://doi.org/10.2136/vzj2018.08.0146, 2019.
- 891 Good, S. P., Noone, D., and Bowen, G.: Hydrologic connectivity constrains partitioning of global-
- terrestrial water fluxes, Science, 349, 175–177, https://doi.org/10.1126/science.aaa5931,-
- 893 <u>20155194/essd-13-1593-2021, 2021</u>.
- 894 Gutmann, E. D. and Small, E. E.: A comparison of land surface model soil hydraulic properties
- estimated by inverse modeling and pedotransfer functions, Water Resour. Res., 43, W05418,
- 896 https://doi.org/10.1029/2006WR005135, 2007.
- 897 Haghverdi, A., Öztürk, H. S., and Durner, W: Studying Unimodal, Bimodal, PDI and Bimodal-
- 898 PDI Variants of Multiple Soil Water Retention Models: II. Evaluation of Parametric Pedotransfer
- 899 <u>Functions Against Direct Fits, Water, 12, 896, https://doi.org/10.3390/w12030896, 2020.</u>

900	Hohenbrink, T. L., Jackisch, C., Durner, W., Germer, K., Iden, S. C., Kreiselmeier, J., Leuther, F.,
901	Metzger, J. C., Naseri, M., and Peters, A.: Soil water retention and hydraulic conductivity
902	measured in a wide saturation range, Earth Syst. Sci. Data Discuss. [preprint],
903	https://doi.org/10.5194/essd-2023-74, 29 March 2023.
904	Huggett, R.: Soil as part of the Earth system, Prog. Phys. Geog., 47, 454-466,
905	https://doi.org/10.1177/03091333221147655, 2023.
906	Hulsman, P., Savenije, H. H. G., and Hrachowitz, M.: Learning from satellite observations:
907	increased understanding of catchment processes through stepwise model improvement, Hydrol.
908	Earth Syst. Sci., 25, 957-982, https://doi.org/10.5194/hess-25-957-2021, 2021a.
909	Hulsman, P., Hrachowitz, M., and Savenije, H. H. G. : Improving the representation of long-term
910	storage variations with conceptual hydrological models in data-scarce regions, Water Resour. Res.,
911	57, e2020WR028837, https://doi.org/10.1029/2020WR028837, 2021b.
912	Jackisch, C., Hassler, S.K., Hohenbrink, T.L., Blume, T., Laudon, H., McMillan, H., Saco, P., and
913	Van Schaik, L.: Preface: Linking landscape organisation and hydrological functioning: from
914	hypotheses and observations to concepts, models and understanding, Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci., 25,
915	5277-5285, https://doi.org/10.5194/hess-25-5277-2021, 2021.
916	Hrachowitz, M., Benettin, P., van Breukelen, B. M., Fovet, O., Howden, N. J. K., Ruiz, L., van der
917	Velde, Y., and Wade, A. J .: Transit timesthe link between hydrology and water quality at the
918	catchment scale, Wiley Interdiscip. RevWater, 3, 629-657, https://doi.org/10.1002/wat2.1155,-
919	2016.
920	Jarvis, N., Koestel, J., and Larsbo, M.: Understanding Preferential Flow in the Vadose Zone:
921	Recent Advances and Future Prospects, Vadose Zone J., 15, <u>1-11,</u>
922	https://doi.org/10.2136/vzj2016.09.0075, 2016.
923	Jung, M., Schwalm, C., Migliavacca, M., Walther, S., Camps-Valls, G., Koirala, <u>Kishné</u> S.,-
924	Anthoni, P., Besnard, S., Bodesheim, P., Carvalhais, N., Chevallier, F., Gans, F., Goll, D. S.,
925	Haverd, V., Kohler, P., Ichii, K., Jain, A. <u>S., K., Liu, J., Lombardozzi, D., Nabel, J. E. M. S.,</u>
926	Nelson, J. A., O'Sullivan, M., Pallandt, M., Papale, D., Peters, W., Pongratz, J., Roedenbeck, C.,-
927	Sitch, S., Tramontana, G., Walker, A., Weber, U., and Reichstein, M.: Scaling carbon fluxes from
928	eddy covariance sites to globe: Synthesis and evaluation of the FLUXCOM approach,
929	Biogeosciences, 17, 1343-1365, https://doi.org/10.5194/bg-17-1343-2020, 2020.
930	Kirchner, J.: A double paradox in catchment hydrology and geochemistry, Hydrol. Process., 17,-
931	871-874, https://doi.org/10.1002/hyp.5108, 2003.
932	Kishne, A. Sz., Yimam, Y. T., Morgan, C. L. S., and & Dornblaser, B. C.:. Evaluation and
933	improvement of the default soil hydraulic parameters for the Noah Land Surface Model, model. Page 36 of 42

934	Geoderma, 285, 247–259 , https://doi.org/10.1016/j.geoderma.2016.09.022,
935	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.geoderma.2016.09.022, 2017.
026	Visiden A. Clabel detects of a stine man doublinformal form interested at I. Climeter 17
930	Kieldon, A.: Global datasets of rooting zone depth inferred from inverse methods, J. Climate, 17,
957	2/14-2/22, doi:10.11/3/1320-0442(2004)01/<2/14:0DORZD>2.0.CO;2, 2004.
938	Lawrence, D.M., Fisher, R.A., Koven, C.D., Oleson, K.W., Swenson, S.C., Bonan, G., Collier, N.,
939	Ghimire, B., van Kampenhout, L., Kennedy, D., Kluzek, E., Lawrence, P.J., Li, F., Li, H.,
940	Lombardozzi, D., Riley, W.J., Sacks, W.J., Shi, M., Vertenstein, M., Wieder, W.R., Xu, C., Ali,
941	A.A., Badger, A.M., Bisht, G., van den Broeke, M., Brunke, M.A., Burns, S.P., Buzan, J., Clark,
942	M., Craig, A., Dahlin, K., wniak, B., Fisher, J.B., Flanner, M., Fox, A.M., Gentine, P., Hoffman, F.,
943	Keppel-Aleks, G., Knox, R., Kumar, S., Lenaerts, J., Leung, L.R., Lipscomb, W.H., Lu, Y.,
944	Pandey, A., Pelletier, J.D., Perket, J., Randerson, J.T., Ricciuto, D.M., Sanderson, B.M., Slater, A.,
945	Subin, Z.M., Tang, J., Thomas, R.Q., Martin, M.V., and Zeng, X.: The Community Land Model
946	version 5: Description of new features, benchmarking, and impact of forcing uncertainty, J. Adv.
947	Model. Lan, X., Li, Y., Shao, R., Chen, X., Lin, K., Cheng, L., Gao, H., and Liu, Z.: Vegetation
948	controls on surface energy partitioning and water budget over China, J. Hydrol., 600, 125646,
949	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jhydrol.2020.125646, 2021.
950	Lion X Diao S Huntingford C Li V Zeng Z Wang X Ciais D McVicar T D Deng S
950	Ottle C. Vang H. Vang V. Zhang V. and Wang T: Partitioning global land avanatronomization
951	voine, C., Tang, T., Tang, T., Zhang, T., and Wang, T.: Partitioning global land evaporation-
952	using CMIP5 models constrained by observations, Nat. Chin. Chang., 8, 640–646,
953	https://doi.org/10.1038/s41338-018-0207-9, 2018.
954	Earth Syst., 11, 4245-4287, https://doi.org/10.1029/2018MS001583, 2019.
955	Lin, H., Bouma, J., Pachepsky, Y., Western, A., Thompson, J., van Genuchten, R., Vogel, HJ.,
956	and Lilly, A.: Hydropedology: Synergistic integration of pedology and hydrology, Water Resour.
957	Res., 42, W05301, https://doi.org/10.1029/2005WR004085, 2006.
958	Lindström, G., Johansson, B., Persson, M., Gardelin, M., and Bergström, S.: Development and test
959	of the distributed HBV-96 hydrological model, J. Hydrol., 201, 272-288,
960	https://doi.org/10.1016/S0022-1694(97)00041-3, 1997.
0.61	
961	Lu, H., Yuan, W., and Chen, X.: A processes-based dynamic root growth model integrated into the
962	ecosystem model, J. Adv. Model. Earth Syst., 11, 4614–4628,
963	https://doi.org/10.1029/2019MS001846, 2019.
964	Mao, G. and Liu, J.: WAYS v1: A hydrological model for root zone water storage simulation on a-
965	global scale, Geosci. Model Dev., 12, 5267-5289, https://doi.org/10.5194/gmd-12-5267-2019,-
966	2019.
967	McCormick, E. L., Dralle, D. N., Hahm, W. J., Tune, A. K., Schmidt, L. M., Chadwick, K. D., and Page 37 of 42

- Rempe, D. M.: Widespread woody plant use of water stored in bedrock, Nature, 597, 225–229,
 https://doi.org/10.1038/s41586-021-03761-3, 2021.
- 970 McDonnell, J. J., Sivapalan, M., Vache, K., Dunn, S., Grant, G., Haggerty, R., Hinz, C., Hooper,
- 971 R., Kirchner, J., Roderick, M. L., Selker, J., and Weiler, M.: Moving beyond heterogeneity and
- process complexity: A new vision for watershed hydrology, Water Resour. Res., 43, W07301,
- 973 https://doi.org/10.1029/2006WR005467, 2007.
- 974 McDonnell, J. J.: The two water worlds hypothesis: ecohydrological separation of water between-
- 975 streams and trees?, Wiley Interdiscip. Rev.-Water, 1, 323–329, https://doi.org/10.1002/wat2.1027,
- 976 2014., Spence, C., Karran, D. J., van Meerveld, H. J., and Harman, C. J.: Fill-and-spill: A process
- 977 <u>description of runoff generation at the scale of the beholder, Water Resour. Res., 57,</u>
- 978 <u>e2020WR027514</u>, https://doi.org/10.1029/2020WR027514, 2021.
- 979 Muecher, C. A., Klijn, J. A., Wascher, D. M., and Schaminee, J. H. J.: A new European Landscape-
- 980 Classification (LANMAP): A transparent, flexible and user-oriented methodology to distinguish-
- 981 landscapes, Ecol. Indic., 10, 87–103, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolind.2009.03.018, 2010.
- 982 Nijzink, R. C., Almeida, S., Pechlivanidis, I. G., Capell, R., Gustafssons, D., Arheimer, B.,-
- Parajka, J., Freer, J., Han, D., Wagener, T., van Nooijen, R. R. P., Moore, R. J.: The PDM rainfallrunoff model, Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci., 11, 483–499, https://doi.org/10.5194/hess-11-483-2007,
 2007.
- $\frac{2007}{2007}$
- 986 Nijzink, R.C. Savenije, H. H. G., and Hraehowitz, M.:-Constraining conceptual hydrologicalmodels
- 987 with multiple information sources, Water Resour. Res., 54, 8332-8362,
- 988 https://doi.org/10.1029/2017WR021895, 2018.
- 989 Nijzink, R., Hutton, C., Pechlivanidis, I., Capell, R., Arheimer, B., Freer, J., Han, D., Wagener, T.,
- 990 McGuire, K., Savenije, H., and Hrachowitz, M.: The evolution of root-zone moisture capacities
- 991 after deforestation: A step towards hydrological predictions under change?, Hydrol. Earth Syst.
- 992 Sci., 20, 4775–4799, https://doi.org/10.5194/hess-20-4775-2016, 2016.
- Or, D.: The tyranny of small scales–On representing soil processes in global land surface models,
 Water Resour. Res., 5556, 1–9, https://doi.org/10.1029/2019WR024846, 2020.
- 995 Perrin, C., Michel, C., and Andréassian, V.: Does a large number: Improvement of parameters
- 996 enhance a parsimonious model performance? Comparative assessment of common catchment
- 997 model structures on 429 catchments for streamflow simulation, J. Hydrol., 242279, 275-301,
- 998 https://doi.org/10.1016/S0022-1694(00)00393-0, 2001-289, https://doi.org/10.1016/S0022-
- 999 <u>1694(03)00225-7, 2003</u>.
- 000 Ponge, J.-F.: The soil as an ecosystem, Biol. Fertil. Soils, 51, 645–648,
- 1001 https://doi.org/10.1007/s00374-015-1016-1, 2015.

Page 38 of 42

- 1002 Refsgaard, J. C., Stisen, S., and Koch, J.: Hydrological process knowledge in catchment
- modelling–Lessons and perspectives from 60 years development, Hydrol. Process., 36, e14463,
 https://doi.org/10.1002/hyp.14463, 2022.
- Reggiani, P., Sivapalan, M., and Majid Hassanizadeh, S.: A unifying framework for watershed
- 1006 thermodynamics: balance equations for mass, momentum, energy and entropy, and the second law
- of thermodynamics, Adv. Water Resour., 22, 367-398, https://doi.org/10.1016/S0309-
- 1008 <u>1708(98)00012-8, 1998.</u>
- 1009 Rodríguez-Iturbe, I. and Porporato, A.: Ecohydrology of water-controlled ecosystems: Soil
- 1010 moisture and plant dynamics, Cambridge University Press,
- 1011 https://doi.org/10.1017/CBO9780511535727, 2004.
- 1012 Savenije, H. H. G. and Hrachowitz, M.: HESS Opinions "Catchments as meta-organisms a new
- blueprint for hydrological modelling,", Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci., 21, 1107–1116,
- 1014 https://doi.org/10.5194/hess-21-1107-2017, 2017.
- 1015 Savenije, H. H. G.: HESS Opinions "Topography driven conceptual modelling (FLEX-Topo),")",
- 1016 Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci., 14, 2681–2692, https://doi.org/10.5194/hess-14-2681-2010, 2010.
- 1017 Savenije, H. H. G.: HESS Opinions: Linking Darcy's equation to the linear reservoir, Hydrol.
- 1018 Earth Syst. Sci., 22, 1911–1916, https://doi.org/10.5194/hess-22-1911-2018, 2018.
- Seibert, J., Vis, M. J. P., Lewis, E., and van Meerveld, H. J.: Upper and lower benchmarks in
 hydrological modelling, Hydrol. Process., 32, 1120–1125, https://doi.org/10.1002/hyp.11476,
 2018.
- 1022 Schoener, G., Stone, M. C., and Thomas, C.: Comparison of seven simple loss models for runoff
- prediction at the plot, hillslope and catchment scale in the semiarid southwestern U.S, J. Hydrol.,
 598,126490, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jhydrol.2021.126490, 2021.
- Shi, P.-L., Tun, B., Cheng, G.-W., and Luo, J.: Water retention capacity evaluation of main forest

vegetation types in the Upper Yangtze Basin, J. Nat.¹ Resourc., 19, 351–360,

- 1027 <u>10.11849/zrzyxb.2004.03.012</u>, 2004.
- 028 Singh, C., Wang-Erlandsson, L., Fetzer, I., Rockström, J., and van der Ent, R. Rootzone storage
- 029 <u>capacity reveals drought coping strategies along rainforest-savanna transitions, Environ. Res.</u>
- 1030 Lett., 15, 124021, https://doi.org/10.1088/1748-9326/abc377, 2020.
- 1031 Sivapalan, M., Bloschl, G., Zhang, L., and Vertessy, R.: Downward approach to hydrological
- 1032 prediction, Hydrol. Process., 17, 2101–2111, https://doi.org/10.1002/hyp.1425, 2003.
- 1033 Sivapalan, M.: Pattern, process and function: Elements of a unified theory of hydrology at the
- 1034 catchment scale, in: Encyclopedia of Hydrological Sciences, edited by: Anderson, M. G., and

Page 39 of 42

- 035 McDonnell, J. J., Wiley, 193–219, https://doi.org/10.1002/0470848944.hsa012, 2006.
- 036 Sun, G., Gao, H., and Hao, L.: Comments on "Large-scale afforestation significantly increases-
- 037 permanent surface water in China's vegetation restoration regions" by Zeng, Y., Yang, X., Fang,
- 038 N., & Shi, Z. (2020). Agricultural and Forest Meteorology, 290, 108001, Agric. For. Meteorol.,-
- 039 296, 108001, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.agrformet.2020.108213, 2021.
- 040 Sternagel, A., Loritz, R., Klaus, J., Berkowitz, B., and Zehe, E.: Simulation of reactive solute
- 041 transport in the critical zone: a Lagrangian model for transient flow and preferential transport,
- 1042 <u>Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci., 25, 1483–1508, https://doi.org/10.5194/hess-25-1483-2021, 2021.</u>
- 1043 Theobald, D. M., Kennedy, C., Chen, B., Oakleaf, J., Baruch-Mordo, S., and Kiesecker, J.: Earth
- <u>transformed: detailed mapping of global human modification from 1990 to 2017, Earth Syst. Sci.</u>
 Data, 12, 1953–1972, https://doi.org/10.5194/essd-12-1953-2020, 2020.
- 1046 Troch, P. A., Lahmers, T., Meira, A., Mukherjee, R., Pedersen, J. W., Roy, T., and Valdes-Pineda,
- 1047 R.: Catchment coevolution: A useful framework for improving predictions of hydrological
- 1048 change?, Water Resour. Res., 51, 4903–4922, https://doi.org/10.1002/2015WR017032, 2015.
- 1049 Tromp-van Meerveld, H. and McDonnell, J.: Threshold relations in subsurface stormflow: 2. The
- 1050 fill and spill hypothesis, Water Resour. Res., 42, W02411,
- 1051 https://doi.org/10.1029/2004WR003800, 2006.
- Uhlenbrook, S.: Catchment hydrology A science in which all processes are preferential, Hydrol.
 Process., 20, 3581–3585, https://doi.org/10.1002/hyp.6564, 2006.
- 1054 Van Looy, K., Bouma, J., Herbst, M., Koestel, J., Minasny, B., Mishra, U., Montzka, C., Nemes,
- 1055 A., Pachepsky, Y.-A., Padarian, J., Schaap, M.-G., Toth<u>Tóth</u>, B., Verhoef, A., Vanderborght, J., van-
- 1056 der Ploeg, M.-J., Weihermueller Weihermüller, L., Zacharias, S., Zhang, Y., and Vereecken, H.:
- 1057 Pedotransfer Functions in Earth System Science: Challenges and Perspectives, Rev. Geophys., 55,
- 1058 1199–1256, https://doi.org/10.1002/2017RG000581, 2017.
- 1059 Vereecken, H., Amelung, W., Bauke, S. L., Bogena, H., Brueggemann, N., Montzka, C.,
- 1060 Vanderborght, J., Bechtold, M., Bloeschl, G., Carminati, A., Javaux, M., Konings, A. G., Kusche,
- J., Neuweiler, I., Or, D., Steele-Dunne, S., Verhoef, A., Young, M., and Zhang, Y.: Soil hydrology
- 1062 in the Earth system, Nat. Rev. Earth Environ., 3, 573–587, https://doi.org/10.1038/s43017-022-
- 1063 00324-6, 2022.
- 1064 Vereecken, H., Weihermueller, L., Assouline, S., Simunek, J., Verhoef, A., Herbst, M., Archer, N.,-
- 1065 Mohanty, B., Montzka, C., Vanderborght, J., Balsamo, G., Bechtold, M., Boone, A., Chadburn, S.,-
- 1066 Cuntz, M., Decharme, B., Ducharne, A., Ek, M., Garrigues, S., Goergen, K., Ingwersen, J., Kollet,
- 1067 S., Lawrence, D. M., Li, Q., Or, D., Swenson, S., de Vrese, P., Walko, R., Wu, Y., and Xue, Y.:-
- 1068 Infiltration from the pedon to global grid scales: An overview and outlook for land surface

Page 40 of 42

- 069 modeling, Vadose Zone J., 18, 180191, https://doi.org/10.2136/vzj2018.10.0191, 2019.
- 1070 Wang, J., Gao, H., Liu, M., Ding, Y., Wang, Y., Zhao, F., and Xia, J.: Parameter regionalization of
- the FLEX-Global hydrological model, Sci. China Earth Sci., 64, 571-588,
- 1072 https://doi.org/10.1007/s11430-020-9706-3, 2021.
- 1073 Wang-Erlandsson, L., Bastiaanssen, W. G. M., Gao, H., Jaegermeyr, J., Senay, G. B., van Dijk, A.
- I. J. M., Guerschman, J. P., Keys, P. W., Gordon, L. J., and Savenije, H. H. G.: Global root-
- 2075 <u>zonerootzone</u> storage capacity from satellite-based evaporation, Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci., 20,
- 1076 1459–1481, https://doi.org/10.5194/hess-20-1459-2016, 2016.
- 1077 Wood, E.F., Roundy, J.K., Troy, T.J., van Beek, L. P. H., Bierkens, M.F.P., Blyth, E., de Roo, A.,
- Döll, P., Ek, M., Famiglietti, J., Gochis, D., van de Giesen, N., Houser, P., Jaffé, P.R., Kollet, S.,
- 1079 Lehner, B., Lettenmaier, D.P., Peters-Lidard, C., Sivapalan, M., Sheffield, J., Wade, A., and
- 080 Whitehead, P.: Hyperresolution global land surface modeling: Meeting a grand challenge for
- 081 <u>monitoring Earth's terrestrial water, Water Resour. Res., 47, W05301,</u>
- 1082 <u>https://doi.org/10.1029/2010WR010090, 2011.</u>
- Weil, R.R. and Brady, N.C.: The Nature and Properties of Soils, 15th edition, Pearson Education,
 ISBN: 978-0133254488, 2017.
- Weiler, M.: Macropores and preferential flow-a love-hate relationship, Hydrol. Process., 31, 15–
 19, https://doi.org/10.1002/hyp.11074, 2017.
- 1087 Winsemius, H. C., Savenije, H. H. G., van de Giesen, N. C., van den Hurk, B. J. J. M., Zapreeva,
- 1088 E. A., and Klees, R.: Assessment of Gravity Recovery and Climate Experiment (GRACE)
- 1089 temporal signature over the upper Zambezi, Water Resour. Res., 42, W12201,
- 1090 https://doi.org/10.1029/2006WR005192, 2006.
- Worthington, S. R. H.: How preferential flow delivers pre-event groundwater rapidly to streams, –
 Hydrol. Process., 33, 2373–2380, https://doi.org/10.1002/hyp.13520, 2019.
- 1093 Wu, J.: Key concepts and research topics in landscape ecology revisited: 30 years after the
- Allerton Park workshop, Landsc. Ecol., 28, 1–11, https://doi.org/10.1007/s10980-012-9836-y,
 2013.
- 1096 Xie, Z., Wang, L., Wang, Y., Liu, B., Li, R., Xie, J., Zeng, Y., Liu, S., Gao, J., Chen, S., Jia, B., and
- 1097 Qin, P.: Land surface model CAS-LSM: Model description and evaluation, J.Xi, Q., Zhong, H.,_
- 1098 Wang, T., He, T., Gao, H., Xia, J., Wang-Erlandsson, L., Tang, Q., and Liu, J.: Spatio-temporal
- variation of gray-green-blue storage capacity in nine major basins of China, Chin Sci Bull, 66,
- 100 <u>4437–4448, 10.1360/TB-2021-0381, 2021.</u>
- 101 Adv. Model. Earth Syst., 12, e2020MS002339, https://doi.org/10.1029/2020MS002339, 2020.

- Yang, Y., R. J. Donohue, R.J., and T. R. McVicar (2016), T.R.: Global estimation of effective
 plant rooting depth: Implications for hydrological modeling, Water Resour. Res., 52, 8260–8276,
 https://doi:.org/10.1002/2016WR019392-, 2016.
- 1105 Zehe, E., Loritz, R., Edery, Y., and Berkowitz, B.: Preferential pathways for fluid and solutes in
- heterogeneous groundwater systems: Self-organization, entropy, work, Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci.,
 25, 5337–5353, https://doi.org/10.5194/hess-25-5337-2021, 2021.
- 1108 Zhang, B., Wu, P., Zhao, X., Gao, X., and Shi, Y.: Assessing the spatial and temporal variation of
- 1109 the rainwater harvesting potential (1971-2010) on the Chinese Loess Plateau using the VIC model,
- 1110 Hydrol. Process., 28, 534–544, https://doi.org/10.1002/hyp.9608, 2014.
- 1111 Zhao, R. J.: The Xinanjiang model applied in China, J. Hydrol., 135, 371–381,
- 1112 https://doi.org/10.1016/0022-1694(92)90096-e, 1992.
- 113 Zhao, S., Hu, H., Harman, C. J., Tian, F., Tie, Q., Liu, Y., and Peng, Z.: Understanding of storm-
- 1114 runoff generation in a weathered, fractured granitoid headwater catchment in Northern China,
- 1115 Water, 11, 123, https://doi.org/10.3390/w11010123, 2019.