Measurement Report: Rapid changes of chemical characteristics and health risks for high
time-resolved trace elements in $PM_{2.5}$ in a typical industrial city in response to stringent
clean air actions
Rui Li ^a *, Yining Gao ^a , Yubao Chen ^a , Meng Peng ^{b c} *, Weidong Zhao ^c *, Gehui Wang ^a , Jiming Hao ^b
^a Key Laboratory of Geographic Information Science of the Ministry of Education, School of
Geographic Sciences, East China Normal University, Shanghai, 200241, PR China
^b State Key Joint Laboratory of Environment Simulation and Pollution Control, School of
Environment, Tsinghua University, Beijing, 100084, P.R. China
^c Institute of energy conservation and environmental protection, China Electronic Information
Industry Development Research Institute, Beijing, 100084, P.R. China
* Correspondence to:
Prof. Li (rli@geo.ecnu.edu.cn), Dr. Peng (mvponesky@163.com), and Prof. Zhao
(zhaoweidong@ccidthinktank.com)
Abstract
Atmospheric trace metals entail significant damages in human health and ecosystem safety, and
thus a series of clean air actions have been implemented to decrease the ambient element
concentrations. Unfortunately, the impact of these emission control measures on element
concentrations in fine particles remained poorly understood. In our study, the random forest (RF)
model was applied to distinguish the effects of emission and meteorology to trace elements in $PM_{2.5}$
in a typical industrial city named Tangshan based on a three-year (2017-2020) hourly field
observation. The result suggested that the clean air actions have facilitated the dramatic decreases
of the deweathered concentrations of Ga, Co, Pb, Zn, and As by 72%, 67%, 62%, 59%, and 54%,
respectively. It is attributable to the strict implementation of "coal to gas" strategies and
optimization of industrial structure and layout. However, the deweathered levels of Ca (8.3%), Cr
(18.5%), and Fe (23%) only displayed minor decreases, indicating that the emission control
measures for ferrous metal smelting and vehicle emission were not very effective. The positive
matrix factorization (PMF) results suggested that the contribution ratios of biomass burning, non-

ferrous metal smelting, coal combustion, ferrous metal smelting, heavy oil combustion, and trafficrelated dust changed from 33%, 11%, 15%, 13%, 3%, and 25% to 33%, 8%, 8%, 13%, 4%, and 33%, respectively. To date, no significant noncarcinogenic and carcinogenic risks were observed for all of the elements, while both of As and Pb still showed relatively high health damages. It was proposed to further cut down the combustion-related emissions (e.g., As and Pb) because it showed the highest marginal health benefits. Besides, the control of traffic-related emissions might be a key abatement strategy to facilitate the reduction of elements in fine particles.

35 Keywords: hourly trace elements; chemical characteristics; health risks; clean air actions; Tangshan

36 **1. Introduction**

37 Along with the rapid economic development and accelerated urbanization, the energy 38 consumption and output of various industrial products worldwide displayed the persistent increases, 39 thereby leading to the massive emissions of elements especially trace metals into the atmosphere 40 (Tian et al., 2015; Zhu et al., 2020). These elements injected into the atmosphere could pose great 41 threaten to the terrestrial and aquatic ecosystem via dry/wet deposition and then endanger human 42 health through the physiochemical transfer and bioaccumulation in food chains (Fernandez et al., 43 2000; Harmens et al., 2010; Storelli, 2008). For instance, some toxic trace metals including 44 cadmium (Cd), lead (Pb), and mercury (Hg) were often regarded as human carcinogens even in trace 45 amounts (Micheline et al., 2019; Olujimi et al., 2015). Besides, the excessive accumulation of some 46 biological essential elements such as copper (Cu), iron (Fe), and zinc (Zn) could initiate activation 47 of inflammatory cascades in tissues and the induction of biochemical synthesis pathways by 48 catalyzing the generation of reactive oxygen species (ROS) (Alies et al., 2013; Lopez-Cruz et al., 49 2016; Saffari et al., 2014), though minor enrichment of these elements was beneficial to the human 50 health and plant growth (Oldani et al., 2017). Apart from the health impacts, some transition metals 51 (e.g., Ni, Zn) could catalyze some chemical reactions such as particle-phase sulfate generation and 52 heterogeneous production and removal of gas-phase hydrogen oxide radicals (HO_x) to aggravate the 53 haze formation (Clements et al., 2013; Guo et al., 2014). Therefore, it is highly imperative to 54 recognize the pollution status of elements in the atmosphere, to identify the major sources and then 55 to propose effective controls measures to alleviate their negative effects on air pollution and human 56 health especially in some developing countries.

57 In the past decades, hundreds of studies investigated the pollution levels of elements and revealed their sources in various study regions including urban (Das et al., 2018; Duan and Tan, 58 59 2013; Lyu et al., 2017; Grivas et al., 2018; Clements et al., 2014), marine (Shi et al., 2015; Witt et 60 al., 2006), mountain (Kang et al., 2016). Most of these studies used the filter sampling (one sample 61 or two samples each day) technique coupled with offline analysis using inductively coupled plasma 62 mass spectrometry (ICP-MS) or inductively coupled plasma-atomic emission spectrometry (ICP-63 AES) to determine the element concentrations in the atmosphere (Ao et al., 2019; Lin et al., 2016). 64 Although these studies have obtained many valuable information about the occurrence levels and 65 key sources of ambient elements, the low time-resolution data cannot accurately reflect the dynamic 66 transformation and evolution of ambient elements. It was well known that atmospheric emissions, 67 transport and deposition significantly relied on rapidly evolving meteorological conditions (Holden 68 et al., 2016; Rasmussen, 1998), and thus the offline samples inevitably ignored the impacts of 69 environmental shifts with rapid temporality on the atmospheric element concentrations. Moreover, 70 most of current source apportionment studies employed the receptor models (positive matrix 71 factorization (PMF)) to determine the potential sources of elements (Jeong et al., 2016; Lyu et al., 72 2017), and the accuracy of these models was strongly dependent on the sample size and time 73 resolution (Liu et al., 2018b). In this regard, the high time-resolved observation of atmospheric 74 elements provided an unprecedented opportunity to characterize the occurrence levels, identify their 75 major sources, and assess the health impacts.

76 To date, only a few studies applied the high-resolution devices to capture the hourly variability 77 of ambient elements. Prati et al. (2000) firstly used Particle Induced X-ray Emission (PIXE) 78 measurements to analyze hourly trace elements in Genoa in Italy. Following this work, A. 79 D'Alessandro et al. (2003) and Dall'Osto et al. (2013) also employed the same technique to 80 determine the trace metals in Italian towns and Barcelona, respectively. Later on, Jeong et al. (2016) 81 used Xact metals monitor to reveal the temporal variability of atmospheric elements in Toronto, 82 Canada in summer and winter during 2013-2014. Recently, the Xact metals monitor has begun to 83 be performed in China due to the higher accuracy and convenience. Chang et al. (2018) firstly used 84 the online multi-element analyzer to achieve a one-year near real-time observation of ambient 85 elements in China and found traffic, nonferrous metal smelting and coal combustion were major sources of atmospheric trace metals. Afterwards, Cui et al. (2019) applied the analyzer to monitor 1-year atmospheric elements, and demonstrated that dust, industry, and biomass burning were considered as the dominant sources of most trace elements in Beijing, accounting for 36%, 10.7%, and 27% of total PM_{2.5} concentration, respectively. Up to date, continuous hourly element observation was only performed less than one year in most of the previous studies, and the longterm temporal variability of absolute concentrations and key pollution sources of atmospheric elements cannot be fully revealed.

93 Since 2013, Chinese government proposed strict Air Pollution Prevention and Control Action 94 Plan (the Action Plan) across China and the emissions of multiple gaseous pollutants suffered from 95 significant decreases. In turn, the absolute concentrations and health effects of air pollutants also 96 experienced the rapid changes response to these stringent control measures. Zhang et al. (2019) 97 reported that the population-weighted annual mean PM_{2.5} concentration decreased from 62 to 42 98 μ g/m³ during 2013-2017 and reduced PM_{2.5}-attributable premature deaths by 0.4 million due to the 99 impact of the Action Plan. Shortly after that, Geng et al. (2019) estimated that the populationweighted mean concentrations of SO₄²⁻, NO₃⁻, and NH₄⁺ in PM_{2.5} decreased from 11.1, 13.8, and 100 101 7.4 μ g/m³ to 6.7, 13.1, and 5.8 μ g/m³, respectively during the same period. Nevertheless, the impact 102 of the Action Plan on trace elements in fine particles still remained poorly understood. Especially, 103 the knowledge about the variation of source apportionment and health risks for trace elements 104 response to the Action Plan was extremely limited. Moreover, most of the previous studies only 105 utilized the original concentrations to analyze the impact of clean air policy (He et al., 2021; Xiao 106 et al., 2020). It was well known that the pollutant concentrations in the atmosphere were affected 107 by meteorology and anthropogenic emissions simultaneously (Li et al., 2021), and the use of original 108 element concentrations alone cannot assess the unique contribution of emission reduction to the air 109 pollutants. Thus, it is urgently needed to remove the effect of meteorology and accurately capture 110 the independent influence of the Action Plan on the chemical characteristics, source apportionment, 111 and health risks of trace elements. Such knowledge is critical to design effective air pollution 112 mitigation strategies in the near future.

113 As a heavily industrialized city located in North China Plain (NCP), Tangshan possesses many 114 energy-intensive industries including coal-fired power plants, non-ferrous smelting industries, 115 textiles, building materials, chemical engineering, and papermaking industries (Ren et al., 2011). 116 Intensifying industrial development and urbanization aggravated local air quality. Previous studies 117 performed in Tangshan focused on the trace metals in soils and dusts (Cui et al., 2020; Song et al., 118 2011), whereas no study analyzed the long-term and high-resolution variabilities of atmospheric 119 elements. Since 2013, many emission control measures such as the establishment of desulfurization 120 and denitration facilities for coal-fired power sector have been strictly implemented in Tangshan 121 (Ma et al., 2019). Especially after 2017, coal to gas project has started to be implemented in 122 Tangshan and the energy structure suffered from significant change (Wang et al., 2020b). In 123 response to substantial pollution control policies, the chemical compositions and major sources of 124 trace elements might show corresponding change. Here, we conducted a near real-time 125 measurement of atmospheric elements in PM_{2.5} using a Xact multi-metals analyzer in Tangshan, 126 China during September 2017 to August 2020. The primary objectives of our study were to (1) 127 determine the occurrence levels of elements in $PM_{2.5}$ of Tangshan; (2) to analyze the seasonal and 128 intra-week variations of atmospheric elements and to distinguish the separate contributions of 129 emission and meteorology to these species; (3) to quantify the changes of major sources for 130 atmospheric elements during this period; (4) to assess the changes of health risks in response to 131 these pollution control measures.

132 2. Material and methods

133 2.1 Sampling site

134 The sampling site (39.66°N, 118.18°E) is situated on the rooftop (~20 m above the ground) of a 135 building in the urban district of Tangshan and no high buildings spread around within 100 m range. 136 The sampling site is close to some major roads including Airport Road, Huayan North Road, and 137 Changhong Road. A large number of commercial streets and recreation facility surround the site. 138 Although no big industrial point source was closely adjacent to the sampling site, many potential 139 pollution sources were located more than 15 km away from the site. For instance, Beihu industrial 140 region is located about 15 km in the eastern direction of the site. Some large iron steel industries 141 and nonferrous/ferrous smelting industries were located on the north of sampling site (more than 30 142 km). Besides, most of large petrochemical industries, coal-fired power plants, and shipping industries focus on Caofeidian and Haigang developing zones, both of which were located about 50 143

144 km in the South area of the sampling site. The detailed location is depicted in Figure 1.

145 2.2 Instrumentation

146 Hourly mass concentrations of 22 elements, including Ag, As, Au, Ca, Co, Cu, Cd, Cr, Fe, Ga, 147 Hg, K, Mn, Ni, Pb, Pd, Sb, Se, Sn, Tl, V, and Zn in PM_{2.5} were determined by an online multi-148 element analyzer (Model Xact 625, Cooper Environment Service, USA) (Table S1). The sample air 149 is drawn through a small spot on the tape where the $PM_{2.5}$ was collected at a flow rate of 16.7 L min⁻¹ during September 2017-August 2020. An internal Pd pod is utilized as an internal standard to 150 151 detect the stability of the instrument. Tl was removed from the datasets because over 95% of their 152 concentrations were below the limit of detection (LOD) (Table S2). Au, Cd, Sn and Sb were also 153 excluded from the datasets because over 50% of the concentrations for these metals were below the 154 LOD. To validate the reliability of online multi-element analyzer, many previous studies used the 155 filter sampling coupled with ICP-MS and ICP-AES to determine the daily concentrations of 156 elements and confirmed that the online device showed good agreement with the filter sampling 157 (Furger et al., 2017; Tianxue et al., 2006). Hourly averaged meteorological parameters including air temperature (T), relative humidity (RH), air pressure (P), wind direction (WD), and wind speed 158 159 (WS) during the sampling period were measured by a weather station with sonic anemometer (150WX, Airmar, Milford, NH, USA). The hourly mass concentration of PM_{2.5} was determined by 160 161 the particulate monitor (Thermo, FH62C-14). The routine procedures, including the daily zero or 162 standard calibration, span and range check, station environmental control and staff certification, followed the Technical Guideline of Automatic Stations of Ambient Air Quality in Tangshan based 163 164 on the national specification HJ/T193-2005, which was revised based on the technical guidance 165 established by the US EPA. Quality Assurance and Quality Control (QA/QC) for the Xact 166 measurements was implemented throughout the sampling period. The internal Pd upscale value was 167 recorded after daily programmed test for the instrument.

168 2.3 Deweathered model development

169 The concentrations of air pollutants were affected by meteorological parameters and emissions 170 simultaneously. In order to separate the contributions of emissions, the impacts of meteorological 171 conditions must be eliminated. In this study, a typical machine-learning model named random forest 172 (RF) approach was applied to distinguish the effects of emissions and meteorological conditions

173 (Chen et al., 2018). All of trace elements in PM_{2.5} were treated as the dependent variables. The time predictors (year, day of year (DOY), day of week (DOW), hour of day (HOY)) and meteorological 174 175 factors including air temperature (T), relative humidity (RH), wind speed (WS), wind direction 176 (WD), and air pressure (P) were regarded as the predictors (Figure S1). The original dataset was randomly classified into a training dataset (80% of input dataset) for developing the RF model and 177 178 the remained one was treated as the test dataset. After the building of the RF model, the deweathered 179 technique was employed to predict the concentrations of trace elements at a specific time point. The 180 deweathered element concentrations served as the concentrations contributed by emission alone. 181 The differences of original element concentrations and deweathered element concentrations were 182 regarded as the concentrations contributed by meteorology. Many statistical indicators including R² 183 value, root-mean-square error (RMSE), and mean absolute error (MAE) were regarded as the major 184 indicators to evaluate the RF modelling accuracy. The RF model with the 5-fold cross-validation R² 185 value less than 0.5 was considered to be the unconvincing result and cannot reflect the impacts of 186 emission and meteorology on air pollutants accurately because more than 50% variability of the training model cannot be appropriately explained. After the model evaluation, only the trace 187 188 elements with the cross-validation R² values larger than 0.5 were selected to estimate the respective 189 contributions of emission and meteorology to the total element concentrations.

190 2.4 PMF model

191 As a typical receptor model applied to source apportionment, PMF 5.0 version was used to 192 identify the major origins of atmospheric elements and to determine the contribution ratio of each 193 source to these elements. The objective of PMF is to solve the issues of chemical mass balance 194 between measured concentration of each element and its source contributions by decomposing the 195 input matrix into factor contribution and factor profile. The detailed equation is shown in Eq. (1). 196 Besides, the contribution of each source for individual element must be non-negative because no 197 sample has a negative source contribution. In brief, the basic principle of PMF is to calculate the 198 least object function Q when the g_{ik} must be a positive-definite matrix based on Eq. (2) (Paatero and 199 Tapper, 1994; Reff et al., 2007).

200
$$x_{ij} = \sum_{k=1}^{p} g_{ik} f_{kj} + e_{ij} \quad (1)$$

201
$$Q = \sum_{i=1}^{n} \sum_{j=1}^{m} \left[\frac{x_{ij} - \sum_{k=1}^{p} g_{ik} f_{kj}}{u_{ij}} \right]^2 \quad (2)$$

202 where x_{ij} and e_{ij} denote the concentration and uncertainty of jth element, respectively. g_{ik} represents 203 the contribution ratio of kth source to ith sample, f_{ki} represents the ratio of jth element in kth source, 204 and e_{ii} indicates the residual of ith element in the i sample. The uncertainties associated with factor 205 profiles were evaluated using three error calculation methods including bootstraps (BS) method, 206 displacement (DISP) analysis, and the combination method of DISP and BS (BS-DISP). For the BS 207 method, 100 runs were performed and the result has been believed to be valid since all of the factors showed a mapping of above 90%. DISP analysis also confirmed that the solution was considered to 208 209 be stable because the observed drop in the Q value was less than 0.1% and no factor swap occurred. 210 For the BS-DISP analysis, the solution has been verified to be useful because the observed drop in the Q value was less than 0.5%. Furthermore, both of the results from BS and BS-DISP did not 211 212 suggest any asymmetry or rotational ambiguity for all of the factors (Manousakas et al., 2017; 213 Taghvaee et al., 2018).

214 2.5 Health risk assessment of trace metals in PM_{2.5}

As a typical industrial city, Tangshan possesses a large number of residents and poor air quality. Therefore, the residents in Tangshan might suffer from severe exposure risks of trace metals. In our work, the carcinogenic and non-carcinogenic risks of trace metals in $PM_{2.5}$ were evaluated based on some statistical threshold proposed by International Agency for Research on Cancer (IARC). Based on the criterion of IARC, As, Ni, Cr, and Pb were considered to be carcinogenic to humans.

The carcinogenic and non-carcinogenic risks induced by meatal exposure for adults and children were evaluated based on the carcinogenic risks (CR) and hazard quotient (HQ). The formulas for calculating ADD, CR, and HQ are as follows:

$$ADD = (C \times InhR \times EF \times ED)/(BW \times AT)$$
(3)

224

HQ = ADD/RfD(4)

 $CR = ADD \times CSF$ (5)

where C (mg m⁻³) denotes the concentration of the corresponding trace metal in $PM_{2.5}$; InhR is the respiratory rate; EF represents the annual exposure frequency (d y⁻¹); ED is the exposure duration; BW is the average body weight; AT denotes the average exposure time; ADD means the daily intake (mg/kg/day) of trace metals; RfD represents the reference dose, calculated with reference
 concentrations; CSF is the cancer slope factor. The potential non-carcinogenic risk of the trace metal
 might be high when HQ was above 1.0, whereas the health risk is not obvious when HQ is below
 1.0. The carcinogenic risk of each trace metal is evaluated based on whether CR is higher than 10⁻
 ⁴.

234 3. Results and discussion

235 3.1 Occurrence levels and inter-annual variations of original element concentrations

236 The total mass concentrations of 16 elements in $PM_{2.5}$ of Tangshan varied between 230 ng/m³ to 20000 ng/m³, with the median value of 3100 ± 900 ng/m³. The total element concentrations in 237 238 Tangshan accounted for 5.7% of the total mass concentrations of PM_{2.5}, which was slightly higher 239 than those in Beijing (4.7%) and Qingdao (4.0%), and significantly higher than that in Shanghai 240 (1.80%) (Chang et al., 2018; Cui et al., 2019). As depicted in Figure 2, the concentrations of these 241 elements followed the order of K (1400 \pm 950 ng/m³) > Fe (880 \pm 590 ng/m³) > Ca (330 \pm 270 242 ng/m^3) > Zn (320 ± 160 ng/m³) > Pb (58 ± 36 ng/m³) > Mn (54 ± 32 ng/m³) > Cu (22 ± 19 ng/m³) > Cu (22 As $(15.3 \pm 11.0 \text{ ng/m}^3) > \text{Se} (6.5 \pm 5.3 \text{ ng/m}^3) > \text{V} (4.0 \pm 3.6 \text{ ng/m}^3) > \text{Cr} (2.8 \pm 2.2 \text{ ng/m}^3) > \text{Ag}$ 243 244 $(2.8 \pm 2.1 \text{ ng/m}^3) > \text{Ni} (2.2 \pm 1.8 \text{ ng/m}^3) > \text{Hg} (1.5 \pm 0.8 \text{ ng/m}^3) > \text{Ga} (0.9 \pm 0.7 \text{ ng/m}^3) > \text{Co} (0.7 \pm 1.8 \text{ ng/m}^3) > \text{Co$ 245 0.2 ng/m³). Among all of these elements, K, Fe, Zn, and Ca were most abundant species, accounting 246 for 95% of the total elements in $PM_{2.5}$. The remaining element concentrations only accounted for 247 less than 6% of the total element concentrations, which was similar to the previous studies (Chang et al., 2018; Cui et al., 2019). Nearly all of the trace elements in Tangshan, Beijing, Qingdao, and 248 249 Shanghai were significantly lower than those in Zibo during 2006-2007 (Table S3). It suggested 250 that the trace elements in China experienced marked decreases in the past decades (Zhang et al., 251 2018). Compared with some cities in some developed countries, all of the trace element 252 concentrations were significantly higher than those in London and Toronto. However, the 253 concentrations of K, Ca, V, Cr, Mn, and Fe in Tangshan were higher than those in Venice, Italy.

Due to the higher exposure risk and great threaten to human health, it is necessary to compare the trace metal concentrations with the risk threshold proposed by many organizations or countries. As shown in Table 1, we have collected many risk thresholds in different countries and found that the Hg ($1.5 \pm 0.8 \text{ ng/m}^3$), Ni ($2.2 \pm 1.8 \text{ ng/m}^3$), and Pb concentrations ($58 \pm 36 \text{ ng/m}^3$) in Tangshan

- 258 were significantly lower than the thresholds of the Chinese Ambient Air Quality Standard (CAAQS)
- 259 (Hg: 50 ng/m³), World Health Organization (WHO) (Hg: 1000 ng/m³, Ni: 25 ng/m³, and Pb: 1000
- 260 ng/m³), Europe Union (EU) (Ni: 20 ng/m³), and the United States (Pb: 150 ng/m³). However, both
- of the As $(15 \pm 11 \text{ ng/m}^3)$ and Cr concentrations $(2.8 \pm 2.2 \text{ ng/m}^3)$ in PM_{2.5} of Tangshan were much
- higher than the standard values of CAAQS (As: 6.0 ng/m³ and Cr: 0.03 ng/m³), WHO (As: 6.6 ng/m³)
- 263 and Cr: 0.25 ng/m^3), and EU (As: 6.0 ng/m^3).
- The inter-annual variation of original concentrations of trace elements in PM_{2.5} are depicted in 264 265 Figure 3 and S2-S3. The original concentrations of all the trace elements exhibited the decreasing 266 trends. Cu, Co, Zn, Pb, As, and Ga concentrations suffered from dramatic decreases from 37 to 12 ng/m^3 (68%), 1.21 to 0.4 ng/m^3 (66%), 400 to 190 ng/m^3 (53%), 71 to 40 ng/m^3 (44%), 20 to 11 267 268 ng/m^3 (44%), and 1.09 to 0.6 ng/m^3 (42%), respectively. Following these species, observed K (40%), 269 Ag (39%), V (39%), Ni (36%), Ca (33%), Mn (29%), Se (29%), Fe (27%), and Cr (21%) 270 concentrations showed moderate decreasing ratios. The observed Hg level exhibited the lowest 271 decreasing ratio from 1.59 to 1.43 ng/m^3 (9.9%).
- 272 3.2 Impact of emission reduction on trace element concentrations

273 Although the original concentrations of trace elements could be utilized to analyze the impact of 274 the clean air policy, the role of emission reduction on element concentration might not be clearly 275 clarified because the meteorological factors were also important variables affecting the air quality. 276 In order to accurately reflect the response of element concentrations to emission reduction alone 277 during 2017-2020, the meteorological conditions were eliminated by RF model in our study. Based 278 on the results in Figure S4, the RF models for all of the species showed better performance because 279 their R^2 values were higher than 0.50, and the slopes of all of the fitting curves were also close to 280 the R^2 values. The result suggested that the separation of meteorology and emission of trace 281 elements based on RF model was reliable. During 2017-2020, the deweathered concentrations of 282 Ga, Co, Pb, Zn, and As showed the rapid decreases from 1.52 to 0.4 ng/m³ (72%), 1.31 to 0.4 ng/m³ 283 (67%), 92 to 35 ng/m³ (62%), 410 to 170 ng/m³ (59%), and 21 to 10 ng/m³ (54%), respectively 284 (Figure 3). It was well known that As, Co, and Pb were typical marker elements for coal combustion 285 and the "coal-to-gas" and "coal-to-electricity" strategies have been widely performed in Tangshan 286 (Fang et al., 2020; Li et al., 2017). Wang et al. (2020a) has estimated that these effective control

287 measures have contributed to around 60% of the total PM_{2.5} reductions. Meanwhile, the upgradation 288 and optimization of industrial structure/layout and the shutdown of high-pollution industries were 289 also strictly implemented in Tangshan, and thus led to the dramatic decreases of Ga and Zn 290 concentrations because Ga and Zn were common forms of nonferrous metal smelting (Tian et al., 291 2015). However, the deweathered Ca level displayed the lowest decrease ratio (8.3%) from 2017 to 292 2020, indicating that clean air actions cannot significantly reduce the fugitive emissions. In addition, 293 the deweathered Fe (23%) and Cr (18.5%) also suffered from relatively low decrease ratios. It was 294 well documented that Fe and Cr originated from metallurgical industry such as steel production and 295 ferrous metal smelting (Tian et al., 2015), and the slight decreases of deweathered Fe and Cr levels 296 during the sampling period suggested that the emission control measures for ferrous metal smelting 297 should be strengthened in the future work.

298 In addition, the decreasing ratios of the deweathered concentrations for each species displayed 299 different seasonal characteristics. The deweathered concentrations of some elements related with 300 industrial activities (e.g., Ga, Zn, and Cr) suffered from rapid decreases in autumn and winter 301 compared with other seasons during 2017-2020 (Figure 4), indicating that the optimization of 302 industrial layout and shutdown of outdated industries were effective to decrease these element 303 emissions especially in high-pollution season. Some elements derived from biomass burning 304 including K (66%) and Se (50%) also suffered from the most dramatic decreasing ratios in autumn. 305 It was assumed that enhanced crop residual burning occurred frequently during the autumn harvest 306 season. Ke et al. (2019) confirmed that the number of fire spots in October-November was even 307 higher than that in June and the burned area in harvest season was highest during 2013-2017. 308 However, the control on open biomass burning has been implemented strictly in recent years, largely 309 reducing the K and Se emissions in autumn. It should be noted that the deweathered Pb (46%), Co 310 (65%), and As (45%) concentrations in winter did not display high decreasing ratios though the 311 annual mean deweathered Pb, Co and As levels experienced dramatic decreases. The result revealed 312 that it was still difficult to reduce the Pb, Co, and As emissions during the heating season because 313 increased coal consumption for domestic heating largely offset the contributions of emission control 314 measures (Zhu et al., 2018; Zhu et al., 2020).

315 Apart from the seasonal difference of each species, the decreasing ratios of these elements also

316 suffered from distinctly intra-weekly variations. The deweathered concentrations of most elements 317 except Ca, Cu, Ni, and V exhibited the higher decreasing ratios at the weekends than those in the 318 weekdays (Figure 5). Cui et al. (2020) has demonstrated that the weaker supervision on industrial 319 enterprises on weekends could lead to the higher concentrations of non-traffic elements such as K, 320 As, Se, and Cr in some cities. Fortunately, grid monitoring has been widely performed in Tangshan 321 recently (http://hbepb.hebei.gov.cn/hbhjt/xwzx/jicengfengcai/101624062321621.html), and many 322 low-cost sensors were installed at some energy-intensive industries, which could decrease the 323 stealing emissions of some elements. Nonetheless, the decreasing ratios of Ca, Cu, V, and Ni did 324 not show the regular intra-weekly characteristics. In recent years, Tangshan adopted strict traffic 325 management regulation and the nonlocal light duty vehicles were restricted to drive inside the urban 326 area one day per week based on the end number of the license plates (Westerdahl et al., 2009; Wu 327 et al., 2011), whereas the restrictions were not valid at weekends (Liu et al., 2007). Theoretically, 328 the traffic control should result in marked decreases of traffic-related element concentrations on 329 weekdays compared with weekends. However, in our study, some traffic-related elements such as 330 Ca and Cu did not show similar characteristics. Meanwhile, as the important tracer of vehicle 331 emission, the NO_x concentration in Tangshan did not show regular intra-weekly pattern. It was 332 supposed that the vehicle volume in Tangshan has increase from 2.0 to 2.4 million 333 (http://tjj.hebei.gov.cn/), which largely offset the benefits of traffic controls. The shipping-related 334 elements including Vi and Ni also did not show regular intra-weekly variation because no heavy 335 metal emission control measures for shipping were performed.

336 3.3 The role of meteorology on the year-to-year variations of element concentrations

337 The difference of original and deweathered element concentrations could be regarded as the 338 concentrations contributed by meteorological parameters. The positive impacts of meteorological 339 parameters on trace elements suggested that the meteorological conditions were unfavorable to the 340 pollutant diffusion, while the negative impacts of meteorological indicators meant the favorable 341 condition to trace elements. In our study, the roles of meteorological conditions on Ca (-25%), V (-342 10%), Cr (-2.5%), Mn (-0.7%), Fe (-4.6%), Ni (-7.6%), and Cu (-21%) during 2017-2020 were 343 negative (Figure S5), while the roles of meteorological parameters on other elements were positive. 344 The result suggested that those elements derived from vehicle emission (Ca, Cu, and Fe), ferrous

345 metal smelting (Cr and Mn), and heavy oil combustion (V and Ni) were less sensitive to the emission 346 reduction actions compared with other elements and the meteorological conditions were much 347 beneficial to the diffusion of these elements. In order to further reveal the key meteorological factors 348 for these elements, we used RF model to calculate the variable importance of all of these 349 meteorological parameters including P, RH, T, WD, and WS. The result suggested that Ca, Fe, and 350 Cu were mainly influenced by T, whereas V, Ni, Cr, and Mn were often associated with WD and 351 WS (Figure 6). During the spring and summer in 2017-2020, the average air temperature decreased 352 from 8.9 and 27 to 7.2 and 26°C, respectively. The decreased air temperature led to the higher water 353 content in the soil and a lower tendency of dust suspension, and might decrease the concentrations 354 of Ca, Fe, and Cu (Manju et al., 2018; Yang et al., 2017; Lyu et al., 2016). Although the annual 355 average wind speed in Tangshan decreased from 1.70 to 1.45 m/s, the mean wind speed from the 356 southeastern direction displayed slight increase from 1.34 to 1.50 m/s. Zhao et al. (2013) verified 357 that V and Ni were usually emitted from heavy oil combustion of ocean-going ship engines. Many 358 coastal ports and ferrous metal smelting industries were located on the southeastern direction of the 359 sampling site, and thus the enhanced WS might promote the dilution and dispersion of trace 360 elements (Figure S6-8). As shown in Figure S8, both of V and Ni showed the higher concentrations 361 in the southeastern part of Tangshan and the concentrations displayed gradual decreases along the 362 Southeast-Northwest transect, which also demonstrated that both of V and Ni in the sampling site 363 could be derived from coastal shipping emission.

364 3.4 The impact of clean air policy on source apportionment of trace elements

365 Although the major sources of elements could be determined based on some important tracers 366 (e.g., K, V), the contributions of major sources to each element still remained unknown. Therefore, 367 Positive matrix factorization (PMF 5.0) version was applied to identify more source information of 368 elements in PM_{2.5} during 2017-2020 based on deweathered levels. After 20 runs, more than 26000 369 samples were trained to determine the optimal six factors with the lowest values of Q (robust) and 370 Q (true). The BS, DISP, and BS-DISP methods confirmed that the most reliable solution was 371 obtained with six factors. The detailed information of PMF analysis and error diagnostics are 372 summarized in Table S4-6.

373 As shown in Figure S9, the trace elements in $PM_{2.5}$ during 2017-2020 showed similar cluster

374 characteristics. Factor 1 possesses high loadings of K (55%) and Se (42%). K and Se were often 375 regarded as the major tracers of biomass burning. Due to the increasing usage of biomass fuels for 376 domestic heating during the heating season, K and Se in PM_{2.5} of Tangshan showed the higher 377 values in winter, suggesting that these metals in fine particles could originate from the combustion 378 of biomass fuels. Except the domestic heating, we found some episodes during harvesting season in 379 late summer (2450 and 11.2 ng/m³) and early autumn (2630 and 9.5 ng/m³) also showed extremely 380 high concentrations of K, which might be linked with local biomass burning (Chen et al., 2017). 381 Based on the map of fire points and backward air masses trajectories (Figure S6-8), the metals 382 released from biomass burning in NCP could be transported to the sampling site by the dominant 383 southerly wind, which further proved the impacts of biomass burning (Chen et al., 2017).

The abundant elements in factor 2 included Ag (53%), Zn (51%), and Cu (36%). Owing to the higher temperatures during the roasting, sintering and smelting processes for the extraction of Cu, and Zn from ores, some metals such Ag in nonferrous metal ores could be vaporized as the byproduct and released into the flue gas (Pacyna and Pacyna, 2001; Wu et al., 2012). Therefore, the factor 2 was interpreted as the non-ferrous metal smelting source.

389 Factor 3 was characterized by a large mass fraction of Co (81%), Pb (61%), Hg (57%), and As 390 (39%). After the phase-out of leaded gasoline since 1980s, the contribution from coal combustion 391 to Pb suffered from rapid increase and accounted for the major fraction of particulate Pb (Das et al., 392 2018). Meanwhile, Co and Hg were also treated as the important byproducts released from coal 393 burning and the Co and Hg concentrations often increased significantly with the elevation of burning 394 temperature (Tang et al., 2018). Tian et al. (2015) estimated that 73% of As, 56 % of Pb, and 47 % 395 of Hg were found to be emitted from coal combustion in China. Coal consumption in South China 396 was mainly driven by coal-fired power plants, while the coal-based heating was the major sector for 397 the coal consumption in NCP. In our study, As, Co and Pb showed the higher concentrations in 398 winter (heating season) (18.7, 0.9, and 76 ng/m³) compared with other seasons (14, 0.6, and 51 399 ng/m³). The markedly seasonal discrepancies of As, Co and Pb strongly supported the impact of the 400 coal combustion for domestic heating on the enhancement of As, Co and Pb in the fine particles. 401 Factor 4 was distinguished by high loadings of Cr (78%) and Mn (39%), respectively. Cr and

402 Mn were mainly sourced from metallurgical industry such as steel production and ferrous metal

403 smelting (Liu et al., 2018a; Tian et al., 2015; Zhu et al., 2018). China occupied more than 49% of 404 world steel production in 2017 (approximate 830 million tons), and 60% large steel producers were 405 located in China (Chang et al., 2018). Tangshan possesses many large steel production industries 406 such as Tangshan Steel, Qian'an Steel, and Guofeng Steel. Besides, some industries of Capital Steel 407 have been migrated into Tangshan (Li et al., 2019), which might increase the Cr and Mn emissions. 408 Factor 5 explained 10.1% of the total species and it was characterized by high loadings of V 409 (88%) and Ni (51%). It was well documented that V was a key fingerprint of heavy oil combustion, 410 which was generally emitted from shipping emission and petrochemical refining (Shafer et al., 411 2012). However, Ni was widely utilized as a tracer of fuel oil combustion in industries (Zhu et al., 412 2018). Many oil-fired power plants were located in Tangshan for central heating (Yu et al., 2013). 413 Based on the backward trajectory and wind direction (Figure S6-S8), we found that high 414 concentrations of V and Ni might be derived from the southeastern air masses especially in summer 415 and autumn, indicating the impacts of coastal port and petroleum refinery industry. In addition, both 416 of V and Ni concentrations displayed the gradual decreases along the Southeast-Northwest transect, 417 indicating the potential sources were located on Southeast Tangshan (Figure S8). Gathering 418 evidence suggested that the V/Ni ratio in petroleum coke with a low-sulfur content and fuel oil 419 usage ranged from 1 to 3 (Moreno et al., 2010). The annual mean ratios of V and Ni in our study 420 reached 1.2 during the sampling period, which was in the range of this interval. The result also 421 revealed that petrochemical refining and heavy oil combustion derived from coastal shipping 422 emission might be an important source of V and Ni the fine particles.

423 Factor 6 was characterized by high loadings of Ca (78%), Cu (32%), and Fe (33%), and moderate 424 loadings of Mn (31%) and Zn (29%). Some previous studies have demonstrated that both of Cu, Fe, 425 and Zn were released from tyre and brake wear because they were the necessary materials for brake 426 pads and the agents in brake linings (Dall'Osto et al., 2013; Hjortenkrans et al., 2007). Ca was 427 probably sourced from the road fugitive dust because it was one of the most abundant elements in 428 the upper continents (Alves et al., 2015; Liu et al., 2018a). Moreover, we have found Fe, Ca, and 429 Zn displayed remarkably high values during the morning rush hours and a small peak during the 430 sunset (Figure S10), which was coincident to the diurnal variation of traffic volume. Thus, the factor 431 6 was identified as the traffic-related dust source.

432 Although six similar sources were revealed during 2017-2020, the contribution concentrations 433 and ratios of these sources varied greatly in these years. As shown in Figure 7 and 8, the contribution 434 concentrations of biomass burning, non-ferrous metal smelting, coal combustion, and ferrous metal 435 smelting to trace elements decreased from 1458, 479, 636, and 569 ng/m^3 to 901, 225, 230, and 345 436 ng/m³, respectively. However, the contribution concentrations of heavy oil combustion and traffic-437 related dust displayed slight increase during 2017-2019, while they decreased rapidly after 2019. 438 The contribution concentrations for nearly all of the sources to trace elements suffered from 439 decreases during 2017-2020 because the total deweathered levels of trace elements experienced 440 decreases in the past three years. However, the contribution ratios of these sources to trace elements 441 did not show similar characteristics. For instance, the contribution ratio of traffic-related dust 442 increased from 25% to 33%. However, the contributions of non-ferrous metal smelting and coal 443 combustion decreased from 11% to 8% and 15% to 8%, respectively. The contributions of ferrous 444 metal smelting, heavy oil combustion, and biomass burning remained relatively stable during this 445 period.

446 Due to the strict implementation of clean air policy, many outdated industrial capacities were shut 447 down and the cleaner technologies have been upgraded, which facilitated the production decreases 448 of pig iron and coal-fired power plants (Ma et al., 2019). Hence, the contribution concentrations and 449 ratios of non-ferrous metal smelting and coal combustion experienced dramatic decreases. Although 450 the open biomass burning has been strictly restricted in Tangshan (Chang et al., 2018), the 451 contribution ratios of biomass burning to trace elements in PM2.5 remained relatively stable, which 452 might be attributable to the rapid decreases of the contributions derived from coal combustion and 453 non-ferrous metal smelting. In addition, the biofuel combustion was still widespread in some rural 454 and suburb areas (Kamal et al., 2015; Li et al., 2020), which might offset the decreases in the 455 contributions of open biomass burning. Although the contribution concentrations of traffic-related 456 dust to trace elements also showed slight decrease, the contribution ratios of traffic-related dust to 457 some trace elements exhibited the marked increases (8%) during 2017-2020 because the 458 contribution ratios of metal smelting and coal combustion suffered from substantial decreases. The 459 result also demonstrated that the implementation of coal to gas project facilitated the decreases of trace element concentrations. In addition, the source variation trend also suggested that the 460

formulation of many new quality standards for non-road diesel fuels cannot fully decrease the element emissions (Cui et al., 2017), and thus the control of traffic-related dust should be enhanced in the future.

464 3.5 Health risk assessment of trace metals in PM_{2.5}

Although the trace metals only accounted for minor fraction of total mass concentration of $PM_{2.5}$, it might pose a great threaten to the human health because most of these metals were bioavailable and non-degradable (Rai et al., 2019; Yi et al., 2011). Unfortunately, previous studies mainly used the filter sampling techniques to determine the concentrations of trace metals and then assess their health risks (Cui et al., 2018; Huang et al., 2016). These low-resolution data might not accurately reflect the real health risks triggered by metal exposure. In our study, we employed the online data to assess the health risks derived from metal exposure.

472 The health risks of trace metals could be classified into two types including carcinogenic and 473 non-carcinogenic risk. Based on the major parameters summarized in Table S7 and Table S8, we 474 estimated both of the carcinogenic and non-carcinogenic risks of major metals. To evaluate the 475 impacts of emission control measures on element concentrations, both of the health risks based on 476 original element levels and deweathered element concentrations were calculated. The mean CR values based on original concentrations were in the order of Pb (2.3×10^{-6} (adult) and 1.4×10^{-6} 477 (child)) > As $(1.9 \times 10^{-6} \text{ and } 1.1 \times 10^{-6})$ > Cr $(0.11 \times 10^{-6} \text{ and } 0.07 \times 10^{-6})$. The total CR values for adults 478 and children reached 4.3×10^{-6} and 2.6×10^{-6} (Table 2), respectively. The total CR values were located 479 480 in the range of the acceptable (10^{-6}) and least stringent risk levels (10^{-4}) , which suggested that 481 Tangshan suffered from slight metal carcinogenic risk. Among all of these metals, Pb and As 482 displayed the higher CR values. It was assumed that the coal combustion for domestic heating might 483 be the dominant factor for the higher risks of Pb and As in Tangshan because both of Pb and As in 484 $PM_{2.5}$ were mainly derived from coal combustion. With regard to the non-carcinogenic risks of trace metals, the HQ of As $(1.2 \times 10^{-2} \text{ and } 2.9 \times 10^{-2})$ and Pb $(6.8 \times 10^{-4} \text{ and } 17 \times 10^{-4})$ showed the higher 485 486 values compared with other elements. The result indicated that nearly all of the elements did not 487 display potential non-carcinogenic risk because HQ values of all the metals were less than 1. The 488 total HQ value of these metals were also lower than 1, indicating that the trace elements in Tangshan 489 did not show significant non-carcinogenic risk.

490 By removing the impact of meteorological conditions, we can isolate the impact of clean air 491 policy on health risks associated with metal exposure alone. The decrease ratios of CR values based 492 on the deweathered As and Pb concentrations during 2017-2020 were 54% and 62%, respectively 493 (Table 3). However, the decrease ratios of CR values based on original As and Pb levels only 494 reached 44%. The result suggested that the clean air policy in recent years significantly decreased 495 the As and Pb emissions. Additionally, the decrease ratios of HQ values for original Cu (41%) and 496 Zn (53%) were much less than those for deweathered ones (Cu: 47% and Zn: 59%). Nevertheless, 497 some other elements did not show the similar characteristics. For instance, the decrease ratios of 498 HQ values for original Cr (21%) and Fe (27%) were even slightly higher than those for deweathered 499 ones (Cr: 19% and Fe: 23%). It was assumed that the clean air policy in recent years facilitated the 500 emission reduction of non-ferrous metal smelting and coal combustion efficiently. However, the 501 concentrations of elements derived from ferrous metal smelting and vehicle emission did not show 502 marked decreases, which was in good agreement with the source apportionment result in the section 503 3.3. Thus, in the future work, it is highly imperative to further reduce the industrial/traffic-related 504 emissions in order to alleviate potential health risks.

505 3.6 Limitations and uncertainties

506 It should be noted that our work is still subject to some limitations. At first, some elements such as Cr (0.5) and Ga (0.5) showed relatively lower CV R^2 values though they were generally higher than 507 508 0.5. These elements might show the higher uncertainties during the meteorology-normalization 509 compared with other elements such as Cu (0.85) and K (0.85). Besides, few variables were applied to deweather the element concentrations, which might be responsible for the lower CV R² value for 510 511 some elements. Due to the lack of available hourly emission inventory of each element, we only 512 used the time variable to train the model. This method still suffered from some uncertainties, which 513 should be improved by the establishment of near-time emission database.

514 **4. Conclusions and implications**

515 Three-year continuous hourly observation of elements in PM_{2.5} was conducted in Tangshan 516 during September 2017-August 2020. The effect of air clean policy on element concentrations in 517 PM_{2.5} were quantified. The main conclusions were drawn as follows:

518 (1) The deweathered concentrations of Ga, Co, Pb, Zn, and As showed the rapid decreases from

- 519 $1.52 \text{ to } 0.42 \text{ ng/m}^3$ (72%), $1.31 \text{ to } 0.44 \text{ ng/m}^3$ (67%), 92 to 35 ng/m³ (62%), 411 to 170 ng/m³
- (59%), and 21 to 10 ng/m³ (54%), respectively. Clean air actions played the important role on
 the emission reduction of coal combustion and non-ferrous metal smelting.
- (2) The deweathered levels of Ca (8.3%), Cr (19%), and Fe (23%) displayed relatively low
 decreases compared with other elements, indicating that the vehicle emission and ferroussmelting industries might be not sensitive to the air clean policy.
- (3) The deweathered levels of some elements related with industrial activities (e.g., Ga, Zn, and Cr)
 exhibited rapid decreases in autumn and winter compared with other seasons during 2017-2020,
 while the combustion-related elements such as Pb and As did not show high decreasing ratios
 in winter. The enhanced coal consumption during the heating season offset the benefits derived
 from strict emission controls measures.
- (4) The favorable meteorological conditions promoted the decreases of Ca (-25%), V (-10%), Cr (2.6%), Mn (-0.68%), Fe (-4.6%), Ni (-7.6%), and Cu (-21%) concentrations.
- (5) The contribution ratios of biomass burning, non-ferrous metal smelting, coal combustion,
 ferrous metal smelting, heavy oil combustion, and traffic-related dust changed from 33%, 11%,
 15%, 13%, 3%, and 25% to 33%, 8%, 8%, 13%, 4%, and 33%, respectively.
- (6) All of the elements did not show significant noncarcinogenic and carcinogenic risks, while both
 of As and Pb still displayed relatively high health damages.

537 Our study presented detailed information about the impact of clean air policy on the chemical compositions and source apportionment of trace elements in PM2.5 in Tangshan, and provided new 538 539 enlightenment for scientific community and policymakers. Many targeted measures could be 540 undertaken to alleviate the air pollution and further to reduce avoided premature health risks. 541 However, this study still suffered some limitations and more steps will be taken toward thoroughly 542 addressing these problems. First of all, the PMF model still showed some uncertainties, and thus 543 characterizing the isotopic signatures of these elements is of great significance. In addition, Sunset 544 OC/EC analyzer, Monitoring of Aerosols and Gases (MARGA) platform, and other on-line 545 measurements should be collocated to probe into the synergistic effect of emission reduction and 546 meteorology on air quality.

547 Acknowledgements

548 This work was supported by the National Natural Science Foundation of China (42107113).

549 **Data availability**

- 550 The boundary layer height dataset was obtained from the website of <u>https://www.ecmwf.int/</u>. The
- dataset is archived in <u>https://zenodo.org/record/7031975#.Ywys8cjfmfU</u> (Li et al., 2022).

552 **Author contributions**

- 553 LR wrote the manuscript. LR, PM, ZWD, and HJM contributed to the conceptualization of the study.
- 554 LR and PM conducted the research, and visualized the results. WGH revised the manuscript.
- 555 **Competing interests**
- 556 The contact author has declared that neither they nor their co-authors have any competing interests.

557 **References**

- D'Alessandro, A., Lucarelli, F., Mandò, P.A., Marcazzan, G., Nava, S., Prati, P., Valli, G., Vecchi, R.,
 Zucchiatti, A.: Hourly elemental composition and sources identification of fine and coarse PM10
 particulate matter in four Italian towns. J. Aero. Sci., 34, 243-259, 2003.
- Alies, B., Sasaki, I., Proux, O., Sayen, S., Guillon, E., Faller, P., and Hureau, C.: Zn impacts Cu coordination to amyloid-β, the Alzheimer's peptide, but not the ROS production and the associated cell toxicity. Chem. Commun., 49, 1214-1216, 2013.
- Alves, C., Gomes, J., Nunes, T., Duarte, M., Calvo, A.I., Custodio, D., Pio, C., Karanasiou, A., and
 Querol, X.: Size-segregated particulate matter and gaseous emissions from motor vehicles in a road
 tunnel. Atmos. Res., 153, 134-144, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.atmosres.2014.08.002, 2015.
- Ao, M., Qiu, G., Zhang, C., Xu, X., Zhao, L., Feng, X., Qin, S., and Meng, B.: Atmospheric deposition
 of antimony in a typical mercury-antimony mining area, Shaanxi Province, Southwest China. Environ.
 Pollut., 245, 173-182, <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envpol.2018.10.125</u>, 2019.
- Chang, Y., Huang, K., Xie, M., Deng, C., Zou, Z., Liu, S., and Zhang, Y.: First long-term and near realtime measurement of trace elements in China's urban atmosphere: temporal variability, source
 apportionment and precipitation effect. Atmos. Chem. Phys., 18, 11793-11812,
 https://doi.org/10.5194/acp-18-11793-2018, 2018.
- Chen, J., Li, C., Ristovski, Z., Milic, A., Gu, Y., Islam, M.S., Wang, S., Hao, J., Zhang, H., and He, C.: A
 review of biomass burning: Emissions and impacts on air quality, health and climate in China. Sci.
 Total Environ., 579, 1000-1034, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2016.11.025, 2017.
- 577 Chen, G.B., Li, S.S., Knibbs, L.D., Hamm, N.A.S., Cao, W., Li, T.T., Guo, J.P., Ren, H.Y., Abramson,
 578 M.J., and Guo, Y.M.: A machine learning method to estimate PM_{2.5} concentrations across China with
 579 remote sensing, meteorological and land use information. Sci. Total Environ., 636, 52-60,
 580 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2018.04.251, 2018.
- Clements, A.L., Buzcuguven, B., Fraser, M.P., Kulkarni, P., and Chellam, S.: Role of particulate metals
 in heterogenous secondary sulfate formation. Atmos. Environ., 75, 233-240,
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.atmosenv.2013.04.038, 2013.
- Clements, N., Eav, J., Xie, M., Hannigan, M. P., Miller, S. L., Navidi, W., et al.: Concentrations and
 source insights for traceelements infine and coarse particulate matter. Atmospheric Environment,89,
 373–381, <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.atmosenv.2014.01.011</u>, 2014.
- Cui, L., Duo, B., Zhang, F., Li, C., Fu, H., and Chen, J.: Physiochemical characteristics of aerosol particles collected from the Jokhang Temple indoors and the implication to human exposure. Environ.
 Pollut., 236, 992-1003, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envpol.2017.10.107, 2018.
- Cui, M., Chen, Y., Feng, Y., Li, C., Zheng, J., Tian, C., Yan, C., and Zheng, M.: Measurement of PM and
 its chemical composition in real-world emissions from non-road and on-road diesel vehicles. Atmos.
 Chem. Phys., 17, 6779-6795, https://doi.org/10.5194/acp-17-6779-2017, 2017.
- Cui, X., Wang, X., and Liu, B.: The characteristics of heavy metal pollution in surface dust in Tangshan,
 a heavily industrialized city in North China, and an assessment of associated health risks. J. Geochem.
 Explor., 210, 106432, 2020.
- Cui, Y., Ji, D., Chen, H., Gao, M., Maenhaut, W., He, J., and Wang, Y.: Characteristics and sources of
 hourly trace elements in airborne fine particles in urban Beijing, China. J. Geophys. Res. Atmos., 124,
 11595-11613, https://doi.org/10.1029/2019JD030881, 2019.
- 599 Dall'Osto, M., Querol, X., Amato, F., Karanasiou, A., Lucarelli, F., Nava, S., Calzolai, G., and Chiari,

- M.: Hourly elemental concentrations in PM_{2.5} aerosols sampled simultaneously at urban background
 and road site during SAPUSS -diurnal variations and PMF receptor modelling. Atmos. Chem. Phys.,
 13, 4375-4392, 2013.
- Das, R., Mohtar, A.T.B.M., Rakshit, D., Shome, D., and Wang, X.: Sources of atmospheric lead (Pb) in
 and around an Indian megacity. Atmos. Environ., 193, 57-65,
 <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.atmosenv.2018.08.062</u>, 2018.
- Duan, J. and Tan, J.: Atmospheric heavy metals and arsenic in China: situation, sources and control
 policies. Atmos. Environ., 74, 93-101, 10.1016/j.atmosenv.2013.03.031, 2013.
- Fang, B., Zhang, L., Zeng, H., Liu, J., Yang, Z., Wang, H., Wang, Q., and Wang, M.: PM_{2.5}-bound
 polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons: sources and health risk during non-heating and heating periods
 (Tangshan, China). Int. J. Env. Res. Pub. He., 17, 483, 2020.
- Fernandez, J.A., Rey, A., and Carballeira, A.: An extended study of heavy metal deposition in Galicia
 (NW Spain) based on moss analysis. Sci. Total Environ., 254, 31-44, 10.1016/s0048-9697(00)004319, 2000.
- Furger, M., Minguillon, M.C., Yadav, V., Slowik, J.G., Huglin, C., Frohlich, R., Petterson, K.,
 Baltensperger, U., and Prevot, A.S.H.: Elemental composition of ambient aerosols measured with high
 temporal resolution using an online XRF spectrometer. Atmos. Meas. Technol., 10, 2061-2076,
 https://doi.org/10.5194/amt-10-2061-2017, 2017.
- Geng, G., Xiao, Q., Zheng, Y., Tong, D., Zhang, Y., Zhang, X., Zhang, Q., He, K., and Liu, Y.: Impact of
 China's air pollution prevention and control action plan on PM_{2.5} chemical composition over eastern
 China. Sci. China Earth Sci., 62, 1872-1884, https://doi.org/10.1007/s11430-018-9353-x, 2019.
- Grivas, G., Cheristanidis, S., Chaloulakou, A., Koutrakis, P., & Mihalopoulos, N.: Elemental composition
 and source apportionmentoffine and coarse particles at traffic and urban background locations in
 Athens, Greece. Aerosol and Air Quality Research, 18, 1642–1659, 2018.
- Guo, J., Tilgner, A., Yeung, C., Wang, Z., Louie, P.K.K., Luk, C.W.Y., Xu, Z., Yuan, C., Gao, Y., and
 Poon, S.: Atmospheric peroxides in a polluted subtropical environment: seasonal variation, sources
 and sinks, and importance of heterogeneous processes. Environ. Sci. Technol., 48, 1443-1450,
 https://doi.org/10.1021/es403229x, 2014.
- 628 Harmens, H., Norris, D.A., Steinnes, E., Kubin, E., Piispanen, J., Alber, R., Aleksiayenak, Y., Blum, O., 629 Coskun, M., and Dam, M.: Mosses as biomonitors of atmospheric heavy metal deposition: Spatial 630 Environ. 3144-3156, patterns and temporal trends in Europe. Pollut., 158, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envpol.2010.06.039, 2010. 631
- He, Q., Zhang, M., Song, Y., and Huang, B.: Spatiotemporal assessment of PM_{2.5} concentrations and
 exposure in China from 2013 to 2017 using satellite-derived data. J. Cleaner Prod., 286, 124965,
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2020.124965, 2021.
- Hjortenkrans, D.S., Bergbäck, B.G., and Häggerud, A.V.: Metal emissions from brake linings and tires:
 case studies of Stockholm, Sweden 1995/1998 and 2005. Environ. Sci. Technol., 41, 5224-5230,
 https://doi.org/10.1021/es0701980, 2007.
- Holden, P.A., Gardeatorresdey, J.L., Klaessig, F., Turco, R.F., Mortimer, M., Hundrinke, K., Hubal,
 E.A.C., Avery, D., Barcelo, D., and Behra, R.: Considerations of environmentally relevant test
 conditions for improved evaluation of ecological hazards of engineered nanomaterials. Environ. Sci.
 Technol., 50, 6124-6145, https://doi.org/10.1021/acs.est.6b00608, 2016.
- Huang, C., Bao, L., Luo, P., Wang, Z., Li, S., and Zeng, E.Y.: Potential health risk for residents around a
- 643 typical e-waste recycling zone via inhalation of size-fractionated particle-bound heavy metals. J

- 644 Hazard. Mater., 317, 449-456, 10.1016/j.jhazmat.2016.05.081, 2016.
- Jeong, C., Wang, J.M., and Evans, G.J.: Source apportionment of urban particulate matter using hourly
 resolved trace metals, organics, and inorganic aerosol components. Atmos. Chem. Phys., 1-32,
 https://doi.org/10.5194/acp-2016-189, 2016.
- Kamal, A., Cincinelli, A., Martellini, T., and Malik, R.N.: A review of PAH exposure from the combustion
 of biomass fuel and their less surveyed effect on the blood parameters. Environ. Sci. Pollut. Res., 22,
 4076-4098, 10.1007/s11356-014-3748-0, 2015.
- Kang, S., Chen, P., Li, C., Liu, B., and Cong, Z.: Atmospheric aerosol elements over the inland Tibetan
 Plateau: concentration, seasonality, and transport. Aerosol Air Qual. Res., 16, 789-800, 2016.
- Ke, H.B., Gong, S.L., He, J.J., Zhou, C.H., Zhang, L., Zhou, Y.K.: Spatial and temporal distribution of
 open bio-mass burning in China from 2013 to 2017. Atmospheric Environment., 210, 156-165, 2019.
- Li, R., Fu, H., Cui, L., Li, J., Wu, Y., Meng, Y., Wang, Y., and Chen, J.: The spatiotemporal variation and
 key factors of SO₂ in 336 cities across China. J. Cleaner Prod., 210, 602-611,
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2018.11.062, 2019.
- Li, R., Zhao, Y., Fu, H., Chen, J., Peng, M., and Wang, C.: Substantial changes in gaseous pollutants and
 chemical compositions in fine particles in the North China Plain during the COVID-19 lockdown
 period: anthropogenic vs. meteorological influences. Atmos. Chem. Phys., 21, 8677-8692,
 https://doi.org/10.5194/acp-21-8677-2021, 2021.
- 662 Li, R., Peng, M., Zhao, W.D., Wang, G.H., and Hao, J.M.: Data for "Measurement Report: Rapid changes 663 of chemical characteristics and health risks for high time-resolved trace elements in $PM_{2.5}$ in a typical 664 industrial city actions", in response to stringent clean air [dataset], 665 https://zenodo.org/record/7031975#.Ywys8cjfmfU, 2022.
- Li, Z., Jiang, J., Ma, Z., Fajardo, O.A., Deng, J., and Duan, L.: Influence of flue gas desulfurization (FGD)
 installations on emission characteristics of PM_{2.5} from coal-fired power plants equipped with selective
 catalytic reduction (SCR). Environ. Pollut., 230, 655-662,
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envpol.2017.06.103, 2017.
- Li, Z., Wang, Y., Li, Z., Guo, S., and Hu, Y.: Levels and sources of PM_{2.5}-associated pahs during and after
 the wheat harvest in a central rural area of the beijing-tianjin-hebei (bth) region. Aerosol Air Qual.
 Res., 20, 1070-1082, 2020.
- 673 Lin, Y., Hsu, S., Chou, C.C.K., Zhang, R., Wu, Y., Kao, S., Luo, L., Huang, C., Lin, S., and Huang, Y.: 674 Wintertime haze deterioration in Beijing by industrial pollution deduced from trace metal fingerprints 675 and enhanced health risk by heavy metals. Environ. Pollut., 208, 284-293, 676 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envpol.2015.07.044, 2016.
- Liu, H., He, K., Wang, Q., Huo, H., Lents, J., Davis, N., Nikkila, N., Chen, C., Osses, M., and He, C.:
 Comparison of vehicle activity and emission inventory between Beijing and Shanghai. J. Air Waste
 Manage., 57, 1172-1177, https://doi.org/10.3155/1047-3289.57.10.1172, 2007.
- Liu, J., Chen, Y., Chao, S., Cao, H., Zhang, A., and Yang, Y.: Emission control priority of PM_{2.5}-bound
 heavy metals in different seasons: A comprehensive analysis from health risk perspective. Sci. Total
 Environ., 644, 20-30, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2018.06.226, 2018a.
- Liu, R., Men, C., Yu, W., Xu, F., Wang, Q., and Shen, Z.: Uncertainty in positive matrix factorization
 solutions for PAHs in surface sediments of the Yangtze River Estuary in different seasons.
 Chemosphere 191, 922-936, <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chemosphere.2017.10.070</u>, 2018b.
- 686 Lopez-Cruz, J., Crespo-Salvador, O., Fernandez-Crespo, E., Garcia-Agustin, P., and Gonzalez-Bosch, C.:
- 687 Absence of Cu-Zn-superoxide dismutase BCSOD1 reduces Botrytis cinerea virulence in Arabidopsis

- and in tomato plants, which reveals interplay among ROS, callose and signaling pathways. Mol. Plant
- 689 Pathol., 18, 16-31, 2016.
- Lyu, X.P., Chen, N., Guo, H., Zeng, L.W., Zhang, W.H., Shen, F., Quan, J.H., Wang, N.: Chemical characteristics and causes of airborne particulate pollution in warm seasons in Wuhan, central China.
 Atmos. Chem. Phys. 16, 10671–10687, www.atmos-chem-phys.net/16/10671/2016/, 2016
- Lyu, Y., Zhang, K., Chai, F., Cheng, T., Yang, Q., Zheng, Z., and Li, X.: Atmospheric size-resolved trace
 elements in a city affected by non-ferrous metal smelting: Indications of respiratory deposition and
 health risk. Environ. Pollut., 224, 559-571, <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envpol.2017.02.039</u>, 2017.
- Ma, Z., Liu, R., Liu, Y., and Bi, J.: Effects of air pollution control policies on PM_{2.5} pollution
 improvement in China from 2005 to 2017: a satellite-based perspective. Atmos. Chem. Phys., 19,
 6861-6877, https://doi.org/10.5194/acp-19-6861-2019, 2019.
- Manju, A., Kalaiselvi, K., Dhananjayan, V., Palanivel, M., Banupriya, G., Vidhya, M., Panjakumar, K.,
 and Ravichandran, B.: Spatio-seasonal variation in ambient air pollutants and influence of
 meteorological factors in Coimbatore, southern India. Air Qual. Atmos. Heal., 11, 1179-1189,
 https://doi.org/10.1007/s11869-018-0617-x, 2018.
- Manousakas, M., Papaefthymiou, H., Diapouli, E., Migliori, A., Karydas, A.G., Bogdanovic-Radovic, I.,
 and Eleftheriadis, K.: Assessment of PM_{2.5} sources and their corresponding level of uncertainty in a
 coastal urban area using EPA PMF 5.0 enhanced diagnostics. Sci. Total Environ. 574, 155-164, 2017.
- 706 Micheline, G., Rachida, C., Celine, M., Gaby, K., Rachid, A., and Petru, J.: Levels of Pb, Cd, Hg and As
- in fishery products from the eastern Mediterranean and human health risk assessment due to their
 Consumption. Interna. J. Environ. Res., 13, 443-455, <u>https://doi.org/10.1007/s41742-019-00185-w</u>,
 2019.
- Moreno, T., Querol, X., Alastuey, A., La Rosa, J.D.D., La Campa, A.M.S.D., Minguillon, M., Pandolfi,
 M., Gonzalez-Castanedo, Y., Monfort, E., and Gibbons, W.: Variations in vanadium, nickel and
 lanthanoid element concentrations in urban air. Sci. Total Environ., 408, 4569-4579,
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2010.06.016, 2010.
- Oldani, K.M., Mladenov, N., Williams, M., Campbell, C.M., and Lipson, D.A.: Seasonal patterns of dry
 deposition at a high-elevation site in the colorado rocky mountains. J. Geophys. Res. Atmos., 122,
 2017.
- Olujimi, O.O., Oputu, O., Fatoki, O.S., Opatoyinbo, O.E., Aroyewun, O.A., and Baruani, J.: Heavy
 metals speciation and human health risk assessment at an illegal gold mining site in Igun, Osun State,
 Nigeria. J. Health. Pollut., 5, 19-32, 2015.
- Paatero, P. and Tapper, U.: Positive matrix factorization: A non-negative factor model with optimal
 utilization of error estimates of data values. Environmetrics 5, 111-126, 1994.
- Pacyna, J.M. and Pacyna, E.G.: An assessment of global and regional emissions of trace metals to the
 atmosphere from anthropogenic sources worldwide. Environ. Rev., 9, 269-298, 2001.
- Prati, P., Zucchiatti, A., Lucarelli, F., Mandò, P.A.: Source apportionment near a steel plant in Genoa
 (Italy) by continuous aerosol sampling and PIXE analysis. Atmos. Environ., 34, 3149-3157, 2000.
- Rai, P.K., Lee, S.S., Zhang, M., Tsang, Y.F., and Kim, K.: Heavy metals in food crops: Health risks, fate,
 mechanisms, and management. Environ. Interna., 125, 365-385, 2019.
- Rasmussen, P.E.: Long-range atmospheric transport of trace metals: the need for geoscience perspectives.
 Environ. Earth Sci., 33, 96-108, 1998.
- 730 Reff, A., Eberly, S.I., and Bhave, P.V.: Receptor modeling of ambient particulate matter data using
- positive matrix factorization: review of existing methods. J. Air Waste Manage., 57, 146-154, 2007.

- Ren, Z., Zhang, B., Lu, P., Li, C., Gao, L., and Zheng, M.: Characteristics of air pollution by
 polychlorinated dibenzo-p-dioxins and dibenzofurans in the typical industrial areas of Tangshan City,
 China, J. Environ. Sci. -China, 23, 228-235, 2011.
- Saffari, A., Daher, N., Shafer, M.M., Schauer, J.J., and Sioutas, C.: Global perspective on the oxidative
 potential of airborne particulate matter: a synthesis of research findings. Environ. Sci. Technol., 48,
 7576-7583, 2014.
- Shafer, M.M., Toner, B.M., Overdier, J.T., Schauer, J.J., Fakra, S.C., Hu, S., Herner, J.D., and Ayala, A.:
 Chemical speciation of vanadium in particulate matter emitted from diesel vehicles and urban
 atmospheric aerosols. Environ. Sci. Technol., 46, 189-195, 2012.
- Shi, G., Teng, J., Ma, H., Li, Y., and Sun, B.: Metals and metalloids in precipitation collected during
 CHINARE campaign from Shanghai, China, to Zhongshan Station, Antarctica: Spatial variability and
 source identification. Global Biogeochem. Cyc., 29, 760-774, 2015.
- Storelli, M.M.: Potential human health risks from metals (Hg, Cd, and Pb) and polychlorinated biphenyls
 (PCBs) via seafood consumption : estimation of target hazard quotients (THQs) and toxic equivalents
- 746 (TEQs). Food and Chemical Toxicology 46, 2782-2788, 2008.
- Taghvaee, S., Sowlat, M.H., Mousavi, A., Hassanvand, M.S., Yunesian, M., Naddafi, K., and Sioutas, C.:
 Source apportionment of ambient PM_{2.5} in two locations in central Tehran using the Positive Matrix
 Factorization (PMF) model. Sci. Total Environ., 628-629, 672-686, 2018.
- Tang, Q., Sheng, W., Li, L., Zheng, L., Miao, C., and Sun, R.: Alteration behavior of mineral structure
 and hazardous elements during combustion of coal from a power plant at Huainan, Anhui, China.
 Environ. Pollut., 239, 768-776, 2018.
- Tian, H., Zhu, C., Gao, J., Cheng, K., Hao, J., Wang, K., Hua, S., Wang, Y., and Zhou, J.: Quantitative
 assessment of atmospheric emissions of toxic heavy metals from anthropogenic sources in China:
 historical trend, spatial distribution, uncertainties, and control policies. Atmos. Chem. Phys., 15,
 10127-10147, 2015.
- Tianxue, W., Yuesi, W., Shihyu, C., and Guangren, L.: On-line measurement of water-soluble ions in
 ambient particles. Adv. Atmos. Sci., 23, 586-592, 2006.
- Wang, S., Su, H., Chen, C., Tao, W., Streets, D.G., Lu, Z., Zheng, B., Carmichael, G.R., Lelieveld, J.,
 and Pöschl, U.: Natural gas shortages during the "coal-to-gas" transition in China have caused a large
 redistribution of air pollution in winter 2017. P. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA, 117, 31018-31025, 2020a.
- Wang, S., Su, H., Chen, C., Tao, W., Streets, D.G., Lu, Z., Zheng, B., Carmichael, G.R., Lelieveld, J.,
 Pöschl, U., and Cheng, Y.: Natural gas shortages during the "coal-to-gas" transition in China have
 caused a large redistribution of air pollution in winter 2017. P. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA, 117, 3101831025, 2020b.
- Westerdahl, D., Wang, X., Pan, X., and Zhang, K.M.: Characterization of on-road vehicle emission
 factors and microenvironmental air quality in Beijing, China. Atmos. Environ., 43, 697-705,
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.atmosenv.2008.09.042, 2009.
- Witt, M.L.I., Baker, A.R., and Jickells, T.D.: Atmospheric trace metals over the Atlantic and South Indian
 Oceans: Investigation of metal concentrations and lead isotope ratios in coastal and remote marine
 aerosols. Atmos. Environ., 40, 5435-5451, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.atmosenv.2006.04.041, 2006.
- Wu, Q., Wang, S., Zhang, L., Song, J., Yang, H., and Meng, Y.: Update of mercury emissions from China's
 primary zinc, lead and copper smelters, 2000-2010. Atmos. Chem. Phys., 12, 18207-18242,
 https://doi.org/10.5194/acp-12-11153-2012, 2012.
- Wu, Y., Wang, R., Zhou, Y., Lin, B., Fu, L., He, K., and Hao, J.: On-road vehicle emission control in

- beijing: past, present, and future. Environ. Sci. Technol., 45, 147-153,
 <u>https://doi.org/10.1021/es1014289</u>, 2011.
- Xiao, Q., Geng, G., Liang, F., Wang, X., Lv, Z., Lei, Y., Huang, X., Zhang, Q., Liu, Y., and He, K.:
 Changes in spatial patterns of PM_{2.5} pollution in China 2000-2018: Impact of clean air policies.
 Environ. Interna., 141, 105776, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envint.2020.105776, 2020.
- Yang, Q., Yuan, Q., Li, T., Shen, H., and Zhang, L.: The relationships between PM_{2.5} and meteorological
 factors in China: seasonal and regional variations. Int. J. Env. Res. Pub. He., 14, 1510, 2017.
- Yi, Y., Yang, Z., and Zhang, S.: Ecological risk assessment of heavy metals in sediment and human health
 risk assessment of heavy metals in fishes in the middle and lower reaches of the Yangtze River basin.
 Environ. Pollut., 159, 2575-2585, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envpol.2011.06.011, 2011.
- Yu, L., Wang, G., Zhang, R., Zhang, L., Song, Y., Wu, B., Li, X., An, K., and Chu, J.: Characterization
 and source apportionment of pm_{2.5} in an urban environment in beijing. Aerosol Air Qual. Res., 13,
 574-583, doi: 10.4209/aaqr.2012.07.0192, 2013.
- Song, Z.F.: An assessment of the heavy metal pollution and potential ecological hazards in urban soil of
 Tangshan City. Geology in China 38, 1379-1386, 2011.
- Zhang, J., Zhou, X., Wang, Z., Yang, L., Wang, J., Wang, W.: Trace elements in PM_{2.5} in Shandong
 Province: Source identification and health risk assessment. Science of the Total Environment 621,
 558-577, 2018.
- Zhang, Q., Zheng, Y., Tong, D., Shao, M., Wang, S., Zhang, Y., Xu, X., Wang, J., He, H., Liu, W., Ding,
 Y., Lei, Y., Li, J., Wang, Z., Zhang, X., Wang, Y., Cheng, J., Liu, Y., Shi, Q., Yan, L., Geng, G., Hong,
- C., Li, M., Liu, F., Zheng, B., Cao, J., Ding, A., Gao, J., Fu, Q., Huo, J., Liu, B., Liu, Z., Yang, F., He,
 K., and Hao, J.: Drivers of improved PM_{2.5} air quality in China from 2013 to 2017. P. Natl. Acad. Sci.
 USA, 116, 24463-24469, https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1907956116, 2019.
- Zhao, M., Zhang, Y., Ma, W., Fu, Q., Yang, X., Li, C., Zhou, B., Yu, Q., and Chen, L.: Characteristics
 and ship traffic source identification of air pollutants in China's largest port. Atmos. Environ., 64, 277286, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.atmosenv.2012.10.007, 2013.
- Zhu, C., Tian, H., Hao, Y., Gao, J., Hao, J., Wang, Y., Hua, S., Wang, K., and Liu, H.: A high-resolution
 emission inventory of anthropogenic trace elements in Beijing-Tianjin-Hebei (BTH) region of China.
 Atmos. Environ., 191, 452-462, <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.atmosenv.2018.08.035</u>, 2018.
- Zhu, C., Tian, H., and Hao, J.: Global anthropogenic atmospheric emission inventory of twelve typical
 hazardous trace elements, 1995–2012. Atmos. Environ., 220, 117061,
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.atmosenv.2019.117061, 2020.

808



Figure 1 The topographic map of China indicating the location of Tangshan (a), sampling site (b), and some major industrial points (b). The population distribution of Tangshan is also depicted in (b).

Figure 2 The bar chart of the concentrations of 16 trace elements including K, Fe, Ca, Zn, Pb, Mn, Fe, As, Se, V, Cr, Ag, Ni, Hg, Ga, and Co.



Figure 3 Inter-annual variations of original (red) and deweathered (manganese purple) element concentrations (ng/m^3) in PM_{2.5} in Tangshan. The dark, nattier blue, and nattier yellow backgrounds represent the species during 2017-2018 (from September in 2017 to August in 2018), 2018-2019 (from September in 2018 to August in 2019), and 2019-2020 (from September in 2019 to August in 2020).



Figure 4 The original (red and orange) and deweathered (green and blue) element concentrations (ng/m³) in PM_{2.5} in Tangshan in four seasons during 2017-2018, 2018-2019, and 2019-2020. S1, U1, A1, and W1 represent the spring, summer, autumn, and winter during 2017-2018. S2, U2, A2, and W2 denote the spring, summer, autumn, and winter during 2018-2019. S3, U3, A3, and W3 are the spring, summer, autumn, and winter during 2019-2020.



Figure 5 Weekly variations of original (green) and deweathered (orange) element concentrations (ng/m^3) in PM_{2.5} in Tangshan. The green and dark backgrounds denote the error bars of original and deweathered elements, respectively.



Figure 6 Relative importance of the predictors for the prediction of trace elements. The columns in the figure represent the variable importance in RF models for trace elements. P, RH, T, WD, WS, DOW, HOY, DOY, and Year denote air pressure, relative humidity, air temperature, wind direction, wind speed, day of week, hour of day, day of year, and study year, respectively.





Figure 7 The deweathered concentrations of trace elements derived from six sources in Tangshan during 2017-2020.

Figure 8 Average contributions of six sources to the deweathered concentrations of elements in PM_{2.5} based on PMF model. The red panel means the biomass burning; the green panel denotes the non-ferrous metal smelting; the blue one represents the coal combustion; the cyan one is the ferrous metal smelting; the pink one represents the heavy oil combustion; and the yellow one denotes the traffic-related dust. (a), (b), and (c) represent the source contributions during 2017-2018, 2018-2019, and 2019-2020, respectively.



Elements	Mean±SD	CAAQS	WHO	EU	United States
Со	0.74 ± 0.24				
Ga	0.86 ± 0.74				
Hg	1.47 ± 0.81	50	1000		
Ni	2.21±1.80		25	20	
Ag	2.75 ± 2.08				
Cr	2.80 ± 2.22	0.025	0.25		
V	3.98±3.57				
Se	6.46 ± 5.28				
As	15.3 ± 11.0	6	6.60	6	
Cu	21.7±18.7				
Mn	53.8±32.3				
Pb	57.6±35.7		1000		150
Zn	320±162				
Ca	332±268				
Fe	881 ± 591				
К	1421±947				

Table 1 The comparison of element concentrations in $PM_{2.5}$ of Tangshan and the standard valuesfor these elements in World Health Organization (WHO), China, Europe, and the United States.

Age	Year	Indicator	Cr	Mn	Fe	Co	Ni	Cu	Zn	As	РЬ
Adult	2017-2018	HQ	2.47×10 ⁻⁴	1.07×10 ⁻⁴	3.55×10 ⁻⁴	4.50×10 ⁻⁴	0.33×10 ⁻⁴	1.18×10 ⁻⁴	3.15×10 ⁻⁴	1.53×	8.39×
										10 ⁻²	10-4
		CR	0. 13×10 ⁻⁶							2.37×	2.88×
										10-6	10 ⁻⁶
	2018-2019	HQ	2.16×10 ⁻⁴	0.89×10 ⁻⁴	2.77×10 ⁻⁴	4.67×10 ⁻⁴	0.23×10 ⁻⁴	0.95×10 ⁻⁴	2.91×10 ⁻⁴	1.21×	7.28×
										10 ⁻²	10-4
		CR	0.11×10 ⁻⁶							1.87×	2.50×
										10-6	10.6
	2019-2020	HQ	1.95×10 ⁻⁴	0.76×10 ⁻⁴	2.58×10 ⁻⁴	3.26×10 ⁻⁴	0.21×10 ⁻⁴	0.70×10 ⁻⁴	1.49×10 ⁻⁴	0.86×	4.69×
										10-2	10-4
		CR	0.10×10 ⁻⁶							1.33×	1.61×
										10-6	10-6
Child	2017-2018	HQ	6.02×10 ⁻⁴	2.60×10 ⁻⁴	8.64×10 ⁻⁴	11.1×10 ⁻⁴	0.81×10 ⁻⁴	2.87×10 ⁻⁴	7.67×10 ⁻⁴	3.73×	20.4×
										10 ⁻²	10-4
		CR	0.08×10 ⁻⁶							1.44×	1.75×
										10-6	10 ⁻⁶
	2018-2019	HQ	5.26×10 ⁻⁴	2.17×10 ⁻⁴	6.74×10 ⁻⁴	11.0×10 ⁻⁴	0.57×10 ⁻⁴	2.30×10 ⁻⁴	7.08×10 ⁻⁴	2.95×	17.7×
										10-2	10-4
		CR	0.07×10 ⁻⁶							1.14×	1.52×
										10-6	10.6

Table 2 The non-carcinogenic and carcinogenic risks for the original element levels in $PM_{2.5}$.

36

2019-2020	HQ	4.75×10 ⁻⁴	1.85×10 ⁻⁴	6.27×10 ⁻⁴	7.93×10 ⁻⁴	0.52×10 ⁻⁴	1.70×10 ⁻⁴	3.61×10 ⁻⁴	2.09×	11.4×
									10 ⁻²	10-4
	CR	0.06×10 ⁻⁶			-		-		0.81×	0.98×
									10 ⁻⁶	10 ⁻⁶

Age	Year	Indicator	Cr	Mn	Fe	Co	Ni	Cu	Zn	As	РЬ
Adult	2017-2018	HQ	3.07×10 ⁻⁴	1.14×10 ⁻⁴	3.82×10 ⁻⁴	10.3×10 ⁻⁴	0.50×10 ⁻⁴	1.33×10 ⁻⁴	3.15×10 ⁻⁴	1.68×	10.8×
										10 ⁻²	10-4
		CR	0.16×10 ⁻⁶							2.60×	3.72×
										10-6	10 ⁻⁶
	2018-2019	HQ	2.73×10 ⁻⁴	0.96×10 ⁻⁴	3.14×10 ⁻⁴	4.93×10 ⁻⁴	0.35×10 ⁻⁴	0.97×10 ⁻⁴	2.91×10 ⁻⁴	1.22×	6.91×
										10 ⁻²	10-4
		CR	0.14×10 ⁻⁶							1.89×	2.37×
										10-6	10.6
	2019-2020	HQ	2.50×10 ⁻⁴	0.82×10 ⁻⁴	2.95×10 ⁻⁴	3.46×10 ⁻⁴	0.36×10 ⁻⁴	0.70×10 ⁻⁴	1.49×10 ⁻⁴	0.78×	4.08×
										10 ⁻²	10-4
		CR	0.13×10 ⁻⁶							1.20×	1.40×
										10-6	10.6
Child	2017-2018	HQ	7.47×10 ⁻⁴	2.77×10 ⁻⁴	9.28×10 ⁻⁴	11.7×10 ⁻⁴	1.23×10 ⁻⁴	3.22×10 ⁻⁴	3.23×10 ⁻⁴	4.09×	26.4×
										10-2	10-4
		CR	0. 10×10 ⁻⁶							1.58×	2.26×
										10-6	10 ⁻⁶
	2018-2019	HQ	6.64×10 ⁻⁴	2.34×10 ⁻⁴	7.64×10 ⁻⁴	11.9×10 ⁻⁴	0.85×10 ⁻⁴	2.36×10 ⁻⁴	1.91×10 ⁻⁴	2.98×	16.8×
										10 ⁻²	10-4
		CR	0.09×10 ⁻⁶							1.15×	1.44×
										10-6	10-6

Table 3 The non-carcinogenic and carcinogenic risks for the deweathered element levels in $PM_{2.5}$.

38

2019-2020	HQ	6.08×10 ⁻⁴	1.99×10 ⁻⁴	7.17×10 ⁻⁴	8.42×10 ⁻⁴	0.87×10 ⁻⁴	1.71×10 ⁻⁴	1.34×10 ⁻⁴	1.89×	9.92×
									10 ⁻²	10-4
	CR	0.08×10 ⁻⁶							0.73×	0.85×
									10-6	10 ⁻⁶